

C.O.N.T.A.C.T.
Desktop research results
Annex 3. Scientific Literature

Cyprus

1. Cyprus Press Articles

Objectives	Brief abstracts or reference when summary is not provided	Bibliography references (when summary is provided)
<p>Press articles raising deep concerns on hate speech in Cyprus and the problematic social context</p>	<p>In this literature we found one typical case study of the prevalent situation. In 2008, forty teenagers attacked a 14-year-old Cypriot girl, whose family had repatriated from Sudan, after her team won a volleyball match, shouting racist comments, punching and kicking her, resulting in the girl's hospitalisation with serious injuries. The incident was reported by the father of the victim, but despite several attempts his complaint was never documented. According to the Executive Director of KISA (NGO), no one was arrested, no statements were taken and no one was charged for that violent crime KISA also criticised the police for failing to demonstrate any sense of sympathy towards incidents of racist violence, as well as for their failure to record such incidents. The Ombudsperson report noted the apparent reluctance of police officers to file a formal report, the relevant authorities silence on the real parameters of the incident, the image of</p>	<p>Toumbourou, Katherine, Welfare: You'll Get Your Baby Back If You Agree to Leave Cyprus. Cyprus Mail. 14 June 10 Evripidou, Stefanos, Probe Ordered into Welfare Staff's Behaviour. Cyprus Mail. 15 June 2010 Hami, Natalie "More needs to be done to combat trafficking", Cyprus Mail.14 September 2011. Mackey, James ,Cyprus racism in the spotlight, http://www.guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2012/mar/13/cyprus-political-racism-doros-polycarpou, http://www.cyprus-mail.com/single-parents/elam-end-benefits-illegal-immigrants-and-help-cypriots/20120707 Racist attacks in Cyprus Statement by ENAR and PICUM (Nicola Flamigni, and Georgina georgina@enar-eu.org), Cyprus Mail, 'Sudanese girl beaten in vicious racist attack' Kouta, Christina and Kaite, Charis ch. 9 "Health Issues among female migrant domestic workers", in David Ingleby et al (eds), Health Inequalities and Risk Factors Among Ethnic Minorities, COST Series on Health and Diversity, Vol. 1, Antwerp – Apeldoorn, Garant Publishers, 2012</p>

	<p>an education system that refuses to accept the nature of this racist incident'. The school's board of teachers investigated the incident and decided to expel one student and suspended five others for a few days not to reprimand the pupils' racist conduct, but to redress the insults that the said pupils directed at the deputy headmistress of the school. Likewise, while the Secretary of the Cyprus Secondary Teachers Union (OELMEK) condemned the incident, he refused to acknowledge its racist nature saying that 'we will not accept under any circumstances that there is racism in our schools'. (from Racist violence in Cyprus)</p>	
<p>Examples of overt racist and mainstream press</p>	<p>These articles are example which show the need of training in the media circles like the SIGMA national TV which declared that migrants have a lifestyle of kings. Some mainstream articles mention the far-right party as the one which represent the best political choice.</p>	<p>Η ΚΑΘΗΜΕΡΙΝΗ, Επιταχύνεται η χορήγηση άδεια μετανάστευσης για αιτητές-επενδυτές, http://kathimerini.com.cy/index.php?pageaction=kat&modid=1&artid=102546, accessed 15 September 2012. Inews, «Πλείστες απόψεις του Ε.ΛΑ.Μ. είναι κρυστάλλινες και με εκφράζουν» Αρχιεπίσκο-πος Κύπρου, http://www.inews.gr/116/pleistes-aporseis-tou-elam-einai-krystallines-kai-me-ekfrazoun-archiepiskopos-kyprou.htm, accessed 2 September 2012. SIGMALIVE, «Φως» σε «Μεταναστευτικό και επιδόματα», ρίχνουν απόψε τα 60 Λεπτά, http://www.sigmalive.com/news/458748, accessed 4 September 2012. SIGMALIVE, Υπουργείο Εργασίας: Διευκρινήσεις για τους αιτητές πολιτικού ασύλου, http://www.sigmalive.com/news/local/275151, accessed 4 September 2012. SIGMALIVE, Αλλοδαποί με καθεσώς... βασιλιάδων, http://www.sigmalive.com/simerini/news/local/459155, accessed 4 September 2012</p>

2. Cyprus Official Reports

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
International Organisations report	<p>United States Government, Trafficking in Persons Report on Cyprus, http://cyprus.usembassy.gov/tip_2012_cyprus_en_jun12.html, accessed 6 September 2012. Amnesty International, Irregular migrants treated as criminals in Cyprus, http://www.amnesty.org/en/news/irregular-migrants-treated-criminals-cyprus-2012-06-18, accessed 4 September 2012</p> <p>Health for Undocumented Migrant and Asylum Seekers Network, Access to healthcare and living conditions of asylum seekers and undocumented migrants in Cyprus, Malta, Poland and Romania, http://www.december18.net/article/new-huma-report-cyprus-malta-poland-romania, accessed 15 September 2012.</p> <p>Migrant Integration Policy Index, Cyprus, http://www.mipex.eu/cyprus, accessed 9 September 2012.</p> <p>Minority Rights Group International, World Directory of Minorities and Indigenous People: Cyprus Overview, http://www.minorityrights.org/?lid=1873</p> <p>Rights Equality and Diversity Network, Red Atlas on Racism and Discrimination, http://www.red-network.eu/?i=rednetwork.en.countries&id=3&view=racismAtlas&s=DEMO GRAPHICS#stands-nav, accessed 1 September 2012</p> <p>Rights Equality and Diversity Network, Red Atlas on Racism and Discrimination, ENAR Shadow Reports: 2011-2012 http://www.enar-eu.org/Shadow-Reports-on-racism-in-Europe-203</p> <p>OSCE ODIHR Reporting: http://hatecrime.osce.org/</p>	Some of these reports such as ENAR and ECRI are commented further below

	<p>http://www.red-network.eu/?i=red-network.en.countries&id=3&view=racismAtlas, accessed 1 September 2012</p>	
<p>ECRI 2011 report complaining about Cypriot authorities reluctance to tackle and prosecute racist offences</p>	<p>The authorities have assured ECRI that all those involved in the criminal justice system have thorough knowledge of the provisions in force against racism and racial discrimination however ECRI noted that these criminal law provisions are rarely applied, Since lack of awareness, nor lack of training may not be the explanation, why no case had yet been presented which would merit prosecution? Another unofficial source reported that there is a general reluctance on the part of the Attorney General’s Office to prosecute for racist related offences. ECRI considers that the above concerns could be addressed by training and awareness-raising for law enforcement officials, prosecutors and judges. In its third report, ECRI strongly recommended that the Cypriot authorities introduce a provision which expressly considers the racist motivation of an offence as a specific aggravating circumstance.</p> <p>Despite positive developments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The criminal, civil and administrative law provisions against racism and racial discrimination are rarely applied. - No records are kept on discrimination cases before the courts or their outcomes. - the Office of the Commissioner for Administration (Ombudsman) lacks sufficient human and financial resources and does not enjoy the freedom to appoint its own staff. It is not well known by vulnerable groups. - Disproportionately high concentration of Turkish Cypriot and Roma pupils in particular schools. The failure to meet the educational needs of these children constitutes an effective denial of their right to education. The lack of any access to education for the Roma children at the Polemidia housing settlement outside Limassol constitutes a breach of the same right. Furthermore, this settlement constitutes de facto segregation from the majority population. - There is a marked increase in racism in schools. - There is no integration policy. 	<p>https://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/country-by-country/cyprus/CYP-CbC-IV-2011-020-ENG.pdf</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The vulnerable situation of foreign domestic workers has not improved. - Legislation is being drafted to combat irregular migration by means of “sham marriages”. - Negative attitudes towards migrants, asylum seekers and refugees are commonly expressed in political discourse and in the media. There is a rise in prominence of extremist anti-immigration groups and extreme nationalist websites hence dissemination of hate speech especially with attacks against Turkish Cypriots. <p>Welcomes</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The drafting of a code of ethics for the media in close consultation with journalists (avoidance of references to minorities, religion and ethnic origin in reporting.) - However there is a need to evaluate the impact of the code in practice. And whether it constitutes an effective means of combating racist and xenophobic discourse in the media; - The ratification by Cyprus of the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime concerning the criminalisation of acts of racist or xenophobic nature committed through computer systems, but the legislation had not so far been applied. - Recommendation should be taken from ECRI’s General Policy Recommendation No. 6 on combating racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic material via the Internet since further steps should be taken to prevent the Internet from being used to disseminate racist and xenophobic comments and material and to prosecute the perpetrators of such acts. 	
<p>ENAR shadow Report 2011-2012 on Cybercrime</p>	<p>In addition to the legal framework mentioned in previous Shadow reports, the legal framework includes Law 26(III)/2004161 adopting the Additional protocol to the Convention against Cyber Crime with reference to the criminalisation of acts of racism and xenophobia committed through computer networks. Maximum penalty for the above acts, provided by the law reaches five years imprisonment, the equivalent in Euros of 20.000 CYP or both.</p>	<p>http://cms.horus.be/files/99935/MediaArchive/publications/shadow%20report%202011-12/Cyprus%20-%20unedited.pdf</p>

	<p>Nevertheless, the only two reported cases under the above law refer to child pornography and there is no officially reported case concerning the criminalisation of acts of racism and xenophobia committed through computer networks.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The media’s role and responsibility for the rising levels of xenophobia and racism in Cyprus is paramount - Possible collusion with media and most political parties from centre to right and promotion of only one narrative - Far-right parties are described as ‘dangerous groups of thugs’ but also as ‘misinformed but understandably frustrated citizens’ - In the name of freedom of expression far-right party voice is always heard through their publications and programmes. - Politicians use the economic crisis against migration (focusing on illegal migrants), the opposite discourse, supported by human rights organizations, activists and some journalists and academics, is less often heard. - The words 'asylum seekers', 'refugees', 'victims of trafficking' 'victims of smuggling' and 'undocumented migrants' are used interchangeably and referred to as 'illegal migrants'. - Positive aspects of migration, migrants’ significant contribution to economic and social growth, the wealth and importance of diversity and cultural richness of migrant communities are not presented. - The life of migrants on the island involves an extremely rich and diverse environment but the media portray a bleak image of migrants as a source of cheap, short term labour, disposable uncritically adopted by society at large. - Linking migrants with rising criminality, rising unemployment and anything negative in society actively contributes to the rising levels of xenophobia and racism in the country. - Muslims are usually presented with hostility, connecting Muslim migrants, refugees and irregular migrants with Turkey and its alleged plan to de-Hellenize and control the island. 	<p>Racism and related discriminatory practices in Cyprus Leandros Savvides, Fezile Osum, Faika Deniz Pasha With the support of KISA – Action for Equality, Support, Antiracism</p>
--	---	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Highlight on the ‘clash of civilizations’ conspiracy (Christian vs. Muslim) suggests in many cases that all Muslims adhere as potentially and likely to join to extremist and terrorist groups. - This is true for the northern part of the island where places of origin of perpetrators of alleged criminal offences is cited and people of Kurdish origin are portrayed as terrorists - Women continued to be underrepresented in the media and negative gender stereotypes continued to be perpetuated. - Social media is not regulated by specific legislation and is exploited by extremist organizations. In the period under review, the resurgence of nationalism and right wing extremist was noted (blogs, FB, popular social media etc.) where accusations and warnings to the “traitors of the nation”, those who “bring illegal immigrants to the country” the urge to deny any rights to migrants portrayed as a ‘burden’ and ‘scroungers’ <p>However different narratives are given by NGOs, civil societies and ordinary citizens.</p>	
<p>ENAR Shadow Report 2010- 211 on reporting hate crime + other sources listed</p>	<p>Academics and NGOs have called for the need to establish effective mechanisms for the reporting of hate crime. Academic research suggests that there is no comprehensive study, nor is there any systematic mechanism of recording racist incidents and discriminatory practices in Cyprus. The only recording mechanism of racist crime is the one maintained by the police, a department which is under-staffed, over loaded with other duties and has limited capacity carry out this function adequately. Another issue presented in the above study is the emergence of an organised racist lobby group composed of certain organisations with an anti-immigration and xenophobic agenda. There are a number of publications and regular media discussions on the imminent 'dangers' of the 'Afro-Asiatic', 'Muslim-Asiatic' and 'Turko-Asiatic' 'hordes' that are ready to 'invade' Cyprus as part of a plan orchestrated by Turkey to change the demographic character of Cyprus through 'illegal immigration'. Although Turkish settlers were illegally brought into the occupied areas by Turkey to change the demographic structure of</p>	<p>M. Kyprianou and R. Veziroglou http://cms.horus.be/files/99935/MediaArchive/publications/shadow%20report%202010-11/4.%20Cyprus.pdf</p> <p>Racism and related discriminatory practices in CYPRUS, Maria Kyprianou, Rahme Veziroglu with the support of KISA- Action for Equality, Support, Antiracism http://cms.horus.be/files/99935/MediaArchive/publications/shadow%20report%202010-11/4.%20Cyprus.pdf</p> <p>http://www.crt.a.org.cy/, accessed 3 August 2011.</p>

	<p>Cyprus,138 the above statement is manipulated through racially motivated hate speech.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - underreport of hate speech: 155 nine complaints were reported (offensive language to certain social and political groups) in 2010 - one complaint in 2011 : “the black employee serving in Cyprus”, in that case, the Cyprus Media Complaints Commission found that it violated the Code of Journalistic Ethics. The European Court of Human Rights rejected as ‘inadmissible’ the argument of freedom of expression - TV show referring to Greeks and Russian as prostitutes on SIGMA which was given a fine amounting to the equivalent of €3,450 for that episode. - Alleged criminals when they are not Greek or Turkish Cypriot have their nationality named; personal information was revealed of a student with AIDS of African origin; - Twisting stories to raise people’s anger and feelings of insecurity is a common practice of politicians. 	<p>Official Letter of the Cyprus Media Complaints Commission, by Mr. Andreas Mavrommatis.</p> <p>Pantelides Poly, ECHR sends Sigma packing, 23 July 2011, Cyprus Mail.</p>
<p>ECRI 2014 related to Crime Report System in Cyprus (4th report) some progress had been made but much more has to be done</p>	<p>ECRI requests that the Cypriot authorities:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. take further action in a number of areas such as data collection referring to the application of the civil and administrative law provisions against racism and racial discrimination. 2. to develop further the Crime Report System and classification of cases by subject matter as well as indicating racist elements to ensure that accurate data and statistics are collected 3. to ensure that new criminal legislation expressly states that the racist motivation for any offence constitutes an aggravating circumstance. 4. the Office of the Commissioner should be granted the necessary human and financial resources to function effectively and independently. 5. To produce Information about rights and non-discrimination in the languages of vulnerable groups. 6. To distribute more evenly Greek-speaking and non-Greek speaking children in different schools. 	<p>https://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/country-by-country/cyprus/CYP-IFU-IV-2014-021-ENG.pdf</p> <p>Akis Christodoulou 2014</p>

	<p>7. To implement fully the programme Zones of Educational Priority to ensure that the right to education enshrined in Article 2 of the Protocol to the ECHR is respected.</p> <p>8. To ensure free transportation to and from school for the Roma children living at the Polemidia settlement in order for them to exercise their right to education. Consultations with the Roma community living at this settlement should be undertaken with a view to closing it down and moving the inhabitants to standard housing.</p> <p>9. To monitor activities of extremist groups and punish incitement to hatred</p> <p>10. to prevent the Internet from being used to disseminate racist comments and material.</p> <p>11. To investigate racist violence thoroughly investigated with a view to prosecution and the perpetrators duly punished.</p> <p>12. To revise their legislative plans to adopt a policy requiring third country nationals to pass a premarital interview with the migration authorities before being given permission to marry Cypriot or EU citizens.</p> <p>13. To have a comprehensive housing policy for migrants and asylum seekers and a body designated to provide housing services.</p> <p>14. To lessen restrictions to the employment of asylum seekers, to facilitate their integration into the job market, to ensure their access to legal aid throughout the asylum procedure and not just at the appeal stage, to make them fully aware of the availability of legal aid to challenge negative asylum decisions before the Supreme Court.</p> <p>15. to publish the number of racist and xenophobic incidents and offences that are reported to the police, the number of cases that are prosecuted, the reasons for not prosecuting and the outcome of cases prosecuted, in accordance with its General Policy Recommendation No. 1 on combating racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance.</p> <p>16. to improve the court archiving system so that cases are classified also by subject matter and clearly indicate racist elements.</p> <p>Progress made on :</p>	
--	---	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the Police Registry of Cases maintained by the Office for Combating Discrimination of the Police, with incidents of a “racist” nature or with a “racist” motive, has been further developed and updated. - The data covers the period 2005 to 2012 and includes information on the number of incidents reported to the police, the number of criminal investigations initiated, the number of cases which were filed in court, and the outcome (pending, suspension, acquittal or conviction). - Additional information indicates the nature of the offence (assault against a person, assault against property, verbal assault and hate speech/ threats/acts), the numbers of victims and accused, the ethnicity of the victims and the accused, and the motive (including language, citizenship, ethnic origin, religion, race and colour). - The relevant data is available on the police website in English and Greek. - steps are being taken to restructure and computerise archiving with the aim of improving both the archiving system itself as well as the information contained in it but nothing has been done yet - the Court Registrar is considering adding a new column to the existing data classifying cases by the subject matter and by indicating “racist” elements. 	
<p>PROGRESS report (2007-2013) (is managed by the Directorate-General for Employment, etc.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The Penal Code should be amended to provide for aggravated offences when these are committed in a racist context and provide for higher penalties when the crime or violence is racially motivated. 2. The police should adopt an efficient and objective way for collecting data concerning racist crime. Police officers should receive special training for identifying, recording and combating racist crime and racist violence effectively 3. Local authorities should make good use of the expertise of related agencies in other EU member states. 4. Victims should be able to report racist crimes and perpetrators should be prosecuted. 	<p>Racist Violence in Cyprus Sharif Chowdhury & Christos Kassimeris 2012</p>

	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. Communication between NGOs and the police should improve for the purpose of reporting and tackling racist crime and violence. 6. The government has the responsibility to promote non-discrimination, cultural diversity and multiculturalism across all sectors of society, particularly in education 7. Collecting data for various statistical purposes is not enough, data collection mechanisms has to be in place with regard to racist violence since racist crimes are often not reported to the police out of fear, especially when irregular-migrants are involved and racist crimes reported to the police are treated as common penal law offences Therefore, the full extent of racist crime in Cyprus is overshadowed by the lack of adequate official data. 	
<p>ENAR shadow report</p>	<p>The period under review has witness a regression of Cyprus as far as human rights abuse, xenophobia, discrimination, racism, which targeted mainly migrants, asylum seekers and refugees, especially with Muslim background, but also Turkish Cypriots, NGOs supporting and advocating for the rights of migrants, and human rights defenders.</p> <p>The problems are :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - denial and, subsequently, inaction and lack of the necessary political will and outlook to come to grips with the situation and confront it systematically and effectively; - Lack of adoption and of implementation of specific policies, systems, mechanisms and measures to address racism; - unchange migration model which restrict migrants as far as work and basic human rights are concerned, leaving them in the margins of society as a source of cheap labour to be exploited and disposed of at will; <p>The economic crisis, the continuing rise of extreme right, the increasing mainstream xenophobic, racist and extreme nationalistic discourse of most political parties, of the church, of the majority of the mass media and in the society at large, further aggravated the situation.</p>	

<p>National Organisations reports</p>	<p>Cyprusexpat, Employment in Cyprus - Remuneration & Minimum Salaries, http://www.cyprusexpat.co.uk/article/id:136/employment-in-cyprus--remuneration, accessed 6 September 2012.</p> <p>Demetriou, Corina, Country Report Cyprus 2011 on measures to combat discrimination http://www.non-discrimination.net/content/media/2011-CY-Summary%20country%20Report%20LN_final.pdf, accessed 2 September 2012.</p>	
<p>Other European reports than ECRI and ENAR</p>	<p>Council of Europe: Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, Third Opinion on Cyprus adopted on 19.03.2010, www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/minorities/3_FCNMdocs/PDF_3rd_OP_Cyprus_en.pdf, accessed 10 September 2012.</p> <p>Council of Europe: European Commission Against Racism and Intolerance, ECRI report on Cyprus (fourth monitoring cycle), http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/Country-by-country/Cyprus/CYP-CbC-IV-2011-020-ENG.pdf, accessed 10 September 2012.</p> <p>Council of Europe: Committee of Ministers, Recommendation CM/RecChL(2012)1 of the Committee of Ministers on the application of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages by Cyprus, http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/country,,,,CYP,,506984e62,0.html, accessed 10 September 2012.</p> <p>Dr Oakley, Robin, Policing Racist Crime And Violence: A Comparative Analysis ://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/542-PRCV_en.pdf</p>	

<p>National Reports</p>	<p>Republic of Cyprus, Equality Body, 2011 Annual Activity Report, 2012 Trimikliniotis Nikos, Sen National Report, 2012. Trimikliniotis, Nikos, Country Report: Cyprus, EUDO Citizenship Observatory, January 2010. UNODOC, Global Report on Trafficking in Persons, UN.GIFT, Feb. 2009. Republic of Cyprus, Anti- discrimination Authority, Report on education of Roma Pupils, AKP 18/2008, September 2011. Republic of Cyprus, Anti- discrimination Authority, Report on registration of foreign students in Primary and Secondary Schools, AKP AYT 2/2009, AKP 66/2010, September 2011. Republic of Cyprus, Anti- discrimination Authority, Report on celebration of the sacrament of confession in schools, AKP 42/2010, July 2011. Republic of Cyprus, Anti- discrimination Authority, Report on establishing the principle of non-discrimination regarding partnership between heterosexual and homosexual couples , AKI 1/2011, December 2011 Kyriakou, Nikolas and Kaya, Nurcan, Minority rights: Solutions to the Cyprus conflict, Minority Rights Group International March 2011 Ministry of Justice and Public Order, 11 September 2014. http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Racism/AdHoc/6thSession/Cyprus.pdf</p>	
<p>The Council Framework Decision 2008/ 913 /JHA of 28 November 2008 as transposed in the Cypriot Law</p>	<p>“Within the framework of the transposition of the Council Framework Decision 2008/ 913 /JHA of 28 November 2008 on Combatting certain Forms of Expressions of Racism and Xenophobia by means of criminal law into national law, a new law has been enacted on 21 October 2011 (The (Combatting Certain Forms and Expressions of Racism and Xenophobia by means of Criminal Law of 2011, Law No. 134 (I) / 2011) in order that the Republic of Cyprus secure the supremacy of the EU acquis in the Cypriot domestic legal order</p>	
<p>Elsa report and</p>	<p>Cypriot case law on hate speech and more generally on racism and related forms of discrimination in the media is under-developed, mainly given that only four years have passed since the enactment of Law 134 (I)/2011. This is</p>	

Trimikliniotis' s interview	due mainly to absence of effective national reporting mechanisms and the apparent unwillingness by the Attorney General to prosecute offenders. The Head of the Police Bureau For Combating Discriminations stated that although incidents are recorded by the Police as "racists", perpetrators of racially motivated crimes are not prosecuted due to an evident reluctance by the Attorney General	
Alternative Methods of Tackling Hate Speech	Alternative Methods of Tackling Hate Speech Framework Decision 2008/913 predominantly provides for the use of criminal law to tackle hate crime. However, Article 6 provides examples of other penalties which member states may wish to apply, such as: a) exclusion from entitlement to public benefits or aid; b) temporary or permanent disqualification from the practice of commercial activities; c) placing under judicial supervision; d) a judicial winding-up order.	http://files.elsa.org/AA/Final_Report_OHS_Final.pdf
ELSA's report Online hate speech and legislation mechanisms in Cyprus	Cypriot criminal law tackles specific crimes relating to religion the Penal Code criminalises persons who have intentionally offended religious groups either by oral statements, actions or publications, which have a religiously offensive character. encompassing hate speech in their scope. It was initially aimed to resolve inter-communal tensions between Greek and Turkish Cypriots in the early 1960s. As a consequence, they are not directly aimed at combating hate	http://files.elsa.org/AA/Final_Report_OHS_Final.pdf

	<p>speech, racial discourse or racially motivated crime. The penalty for such crimes does not exceed one year imprisonment</p> <p>Online hate speech could conceivably fall within the scope of Article 3(1) Law 134(I)/2011, even if it is not explicitly provided for, especially if conjunctively read with Article 4 of Law 26(III)/2004. To successfully prosecute the crime of hate speech, we need:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - a public transmission of the hate speech which, by definition, will occur when such speech is disseminated on the internet. - against a group of people, or a member of that group, which is formed on the basis of the protected grounds, for example race or religion. - causing a public disorder or have a threatening, abusive or offensive character. - Must be committed 'deliberately' i.e. with the specific intent to commit the offence in question. This requirement is particularly difficult to satisfy using existing evidence law principles as it places the bar on proving the subjective intention high <p>What is missing in Cyprus law:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - no current debate in the House of Representatives of Cyprus regarding whether networking sites should be legally forced to reveal the identities of persons in cases involving online hate speech - no public body based in Cyprus has the competence to regulate or monitor internet forms of expression i.e. both the Cyprus Radio Television Authority and the Press and Information Office, clarified that they have no jurisdiction over the internet. <p>The problems with on-line hate speech:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - revealing the identities of persons at the origin of an online hate speech might prove difficult since the revelation of the identity of a person is likely to conflict with fundamental freedom articles of the Constitution of the Republic, such as Article 17, which guarantees the right to respect of one person's correspondence and any other communication 	
--	---	--

<p>Code of ethics published by the government for schools regarding racism</p>	<p>“Η μη αναφορά ή η μειωμένη αναφορά των ρατσιστικών περιστατικών, από φόβο του θύματος, από δυσκολίες στα συστήματα αναφοράς και διερεύνησης ρατσιστικών περιστατικών ή από πεποίθηση ματαιότητας, ότι δηλαδή «δεν θα γίνει τίποτα». Η ελλιπής αναφορά έχει σοβαρές επιπτώσεις: Τα θύματα των περιστατικών δεν ενδυναμώνονται, δεν αισθάνονται καμιά προστασία ή δικαίωση και, ένεκα τούτου, αποδέχονται μοιρολατρικά και παθητικά τέτοια περιστατικά. Έχει, επίσης, δυσμενείς επιπτώσεις σε ολόκληρη τη σχολική κοινότητα: Εμπεδώνεται και επικρατεί το αίσθημα της ανοχής του ρατσισμού και των διακρίσεων, ενώ παραμένει σκοτεινή η φύση και η έκταση του φαινομένου, καθιστώντας αδύνατη την έγκαιρη και αποφασιστική αντιμετώπισή του. Γι’ αυτό είναι πολύ σημαντικό τα θύματα να ενθαρρύνονται, να προστατεύονται και να προτρέπονται να δηλώνουν όλα τα περιστατικά, χωρίς φόβο.</p>	<p>http://www.moec.gov.cy/agogi_ygeias/pdf/odigo_ekpaideftikou/kodikas_symperiforas_ratsismou.pdf</p>
--	---	--

3. Academic Articles

Objective	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
<p>Analysis of the immigration policy of the Republic of Cyprus (RoC),</p>	<p>Immigration policy often results in the denial of the rights of migrants since the mode of immigration control is connected to the particular state of exception in Cyprus known as ‘the doctrine of necessity’. The issue of criminalization, detention and expulsion of migrants and the denial of residency rights are addressed. The article concludes that the repressive migration control in Cyprus is a manifestation of an ill-construed conception of ‘sovereignty’ in a divided country, which the State seeks to justify on the grounds of ‘necessity’ and ‘exception’. The current banking/economic crisis and mass unemployment has provided a fertile ground for racism and xenophobia. The current global and European debates around the ‘states of exception’, ‘emergency’, ‘necessity’, and ‘sovereignty’ in the context of the fundamental disagreement over the issue migration and the racialization of migrants may play a role in the future. The case of Cyprus is discussed, in part as an exception, but also as a particular instance of a broader global and European issue.</p>	<p>Nicos Trimikliniotis. "Trimikliniotis, N. , 2013, Migration and Freedom of Movement of Workers: EU Law, Crisis and the Cypriot States of Exception" Laws 2: 440-468.</p>

<p>The report examines the processes, methods and Practices of the Cypriot educational system as the embodiment of tolerance in discourses and practices addressing cultural diversity in schools. These are mediated by the perceptions of policy makers, the convictions of stakeholders involved in the processes and abilities of and tools made available to educationalists</p>	<p>The ways the educational system treats its minorities shows a view of diversity as a disadvantage and a deficiency that needs to be ‘treated’. There is also essentialisation and reification of culture and ethnicity. The current model of intercultural education is based on contributions and additions by ‘other cultures’, whilst racism is construed as a pathologised individualistic attribute that may be challenged and combated through ‘learning’ about other cultures. At the same time, institutional and structural racism and inequalities are unacknowledged and ignored. Despite the rare instances of resistance and exhibitions of agency by some teachers and children to the dominant discourses and practices, institutional everyday racism operates in various ways and at various levels, negatively affecting the experiences of both the minority and the majority groups and individuals involved. The report concludes that it is essential to constantly rethink the methods and concepts, upon which educational policies are premised, particularly the concept of tolerance/intolerance, and to re-evaluate the situation and renew the conceptual tools to meet the new realities at Cypriot schools.</p>	<p>Nicos Trimikliniotis, Corina Demetriou, and Elena Papamichael. 2012, The embodiment of tolerance in discourses and practices addressing cultural diversity in schools, The case of Cyprus, Available at: http://works.bepress.com/nicos_trimikliniotis/36</p>
<p>Challenge mainstream narrative that presents ethnic identities as historically inevitable and natural</p>	<p>Identities are socially constructed and ethnic or national groups are homogenous actors. This means that we can deconstruct any notion of unitary actors and use a class-based conceptualization of the state. The period between 1878 and 1974 analyses the class structure in the Cypriot society and trace how different classes in both communities positioned themselves vis-à-vis political structures of power ; these positionings paved then the way to the division of the island.</p>	<p>Umut Bozkurt Nicos Trimikliniotis, 2014, Incorporating a class analysis within the national question: rethinking ethnicity, class and nationalism in Cyprus. <i>Nationalism and Ethnic Politics</i> 20 (2): 244-265. Available at: http://works.bepress.com/nicos_trimikliniotis/44</p>
<p>Summary of the radical changes which happened Cyprus</p>	<p>At the level of educational and government policy development, the findings suggest that there is a need to promote diversity teaching and training at all levels of the government following a ‘top-down’ approach where politicians will serve as models of a balance between unity and diversity and not encourage discrimination. The discrepancy between</p>	<p>Marios Argyrides (2013) Ethnic identity person perception and racism: a decade of changes in Cyprus,</p>

<p>since its entry in the European union</p>	<p>the Hellenocentric and Cypriocentric discourses should also be researched and addressed more thoroughly and attempt to bridge their differences, at least for the ethnic identity of indigenous Cyprus people. In a country such as Cyprus which suffers from ethnic and other forms of conflict, similar, strong and healthy levels of ethnic identity, increased levels of perceived in-group and out group core similarities and decreased levels of racism will aid in the handling, dealing and consequently, overcoming these multidimensional, multifaceted conflicts.</p>	<p>Neapolis University Pafos, Cyprus Hellenic Journal of Psychology, 10 : 78-101</p>
<p>This paper maps and evaluates the area of migrant labour integration in Cyprus</p>	<p>Until the end of 2010, when the first national action plan on integration was adopted, the policy framework could only be schematically imagined. Integration requires a serious change in the whole way in which migrants are perceived and are structurally located in society. In particular, it requires a radical reform of the current immigration model which needs to shift from the short-term temporary model to a policy of granting long-term status to migrants who have a vested interest in adapting and producing in Cypriot society. At policy level, the whole approach to immigration policy must break away from the ideology of “control” and, in particular, border control and move towards a more proactive and positive approach towards immigrants and immigration. The basis of the model of reception of migrant workers must be based on a multi-cultural model that promotes equality and non-discrimination, participation and dialogue, belonging, and respect for difference.</p>	<p>Nicos Trimikliniotis and Corina Demetriou, 2011, Labour Integration of Migrant Workers in Cyprus: A Critical Appraisal, Precarious Migrant Labour Across Europe,. Ed. Mojca Pajnik and Giovanna Campani. Ljubljana: Mirovni Institut. 73-96. Available at: http://works.bepress.com/nicos_trimikliniotis/32</p> <p>Trimikliniotis N., Demetriou C., 2008, Evaluating the Anti-Discrimination Law in the Republic of Cyprus: A critical reflection, THE CYPRUS REVIEW 20 (2)</p>
<p>Describes the general context of the Roma in Cyprus and their identity as Cypriot</p>	<p>According to the Constitution of the Cyprus Republic, the vast majority of Roma are classified as belonging to the ‘Turkish community’ without a minority rights status, and they are Turkish-speaking Roma. In 1974, most Roma moved along with most Turkish-Cypriots to the northern part of the island. Since 2004 a number of Roma have crossed</p>	<p>Nicos Trimikliniotis. 2009, The Cypriot Roma and the Failure of Education: Anti-Discrimination and</p>

<p>citizens, their legal classification, cultural identity and population concentration. It examines as well the legal framework within which the Roma of Cyprus are educated considering their access to education, as well as recent legislation transposing the anti-discrimination acquis communautaire.</p>	<p>over and reside in the Republic of Cyprus. Their recent settlement in the towns of Limassol and Paphos and their poor living conditions had a negative impact on the education. Available data on enrolment, attendance, attainment and dropout rates of the Roma pupils is indicative of the seriousness of the situation, most Roma children ending up almost illiterate. The inadequacy of the school curricula, the absence of any teachers' training, the language barriers and the overall failure of the system to recognise Roma culture and contribution to society, are all factors which predetermine the poor performance of the Roma in education. It was also noted the habit of removing Greek Cypriot students from attended by Roma or other minority pupils, against and despite the policy of the Ministry of Education against segregation. This ends up with a concentration of migrants, minorities and Greek-Cypriots from poorer backgrounds in some schools creating ghettos. Seemingly positive local measures intended to desegregate Roma by dividing classes where there are 'too many' Roma result in further marginalising the Roma pupils from the rest of the class. The attitudes of the Roma towards educational provisions are negative, often viewing education as an unnecessary burden that offers them very little. The study finds that the policy-makers' perceptions of Roma children in terms of language ability, are similar to their perceptions of other migrants' children. The failure of addressing their underachievement and exclusion is located in, firstly, a linguistic exclusion, secondly in the lack of interest and focus on Roma identity and culture, and thirdly, in the general absence of a comprehensive intercultural education. Only one primary school with a high Roma attendance has received additional support measures and on close examination, there is very little, if any, link to European-level anti-discrimination policies and recommendations about the Roma children. There are few or no examples of "good practice" initiatives specifically targeting the Roma population by actors other than the public education authorities, but brief references are made to a handful of positive private initiatives on inter-cultural education in general. No special provision is made for the Roma pupils who speak Kurbetcha, a Romany dialect as well as Turkish.</p>	<p>Multiculturalism as a Post-accession Challenge, The Minorities of Cyprus: Development Patterns and the Identity of the Internal-Exclusion. Ed. Nicholas Coureas and Andrekos Varnava. Cambridge: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, Available at: http://works.bepress.com/nicos_trimikliniotis/</p>
--	---	--

Denmark

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
------------	-----------------	------------------------

	(what do they say)	
Overview of Danish far-right extremist activity (history and current groups)	Description of the ideological orientation of the major groups (Nazi and anti-Islam). There is no specific mention of hate speech/hate crime.	Ministry of Justice, Sweden and Institute for Strategic Dialogue, 2012. Preventing and Countering Far-Right Extremism: European Cooperation COUNTRY REPORTS
Relationship between freedom of expression and hate speech	The European Court of Human Rights' judgment in the <i>Jersild v. Denmark</i> case has proved very influential in shaping the contours of the Court's jurisprudence on the relationship between freedom of expression and hate speech. The case involved the conviction of Jens Olaf Jersild, a Danish journalist, for aiding and abetting in the dissemination of racist statements in a televised interview he had conducted. The statements in question were uttered by members of an extreme right-wing group known as the "Greenjackets" and the journalist was convicted largely because he had failed to explicitly contradict, or distance himself from, the racist and xenophobic statements of the interviewees. The European Court of Human Rights held that Jersild's conviction was not "necessary in a democratic society" and that it therefore violated his rights under Article 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights. This conclusion rested largely on considerations of context in (news) reporting and the importance of journalistic autonomy for the functioning of democracy. The Court held that the journalist's right to freedom of expression had been infringed, inter alia, because it was not for the courts to determine which journalistic techniques (e.g. "the methods of objective and balanced reporting") should be used. (p. 43)	McGonagle, T. (2013) <i>The Council of Europe against online hate speech: Conundrums and challenges</i> . MCM Vol. 2013(005). Belgrade: Republic of Serbia, Ministry of Culture and Information http://hdl.handle.net/11245/1.407945 Persistent Identifier urn:nbn:nl:ui:29-1.407945
Description of the Danish People's Party's rhetorical strategy regarding 'islam' and 'islamism' from 2004-2009. (Essayistic)	This publication focuses on the growing antimuslim movement in Denmark, initiated by Dansk Folkeparti, a Danish political party, voicing a strong anti-immigration platform. It is argued that popular anti-muslim opinions as expressed in newspaper articles, home pages, blogs etc. often overlap with Dansk Folkeparti's viewpoints. Muslims in general are framed in a dehumanizing manner: they are involved in animal cruelty, rapes, child abuse, terrorism, and barbarism.	Rune Engelbreth Larsen (2009): <i>Dansk Folkepartis antimuslimske retorik</i> . In A. Jessen (Ed.), <i>Stuerent? Dansk Folkeparti, populisme, antimuslimske retorik og offermytologi</i> (pp. 85–100). København: Frydenlund.
Free speech vs. self-censorship by	In this publication, Tavshedens Tyranni (<i>The Tyranny of Silence</i>), Rose puts focus on how modern Europe should approach increased diversity in	Rose, Flemming (2010). <i>Tavshedens tyranni</i> Flemming Rose

<p>individuals and societies confronted with/by “combative cultures”. (Essayistic)</p>	<p>populations. He argues that Europe has developed from having totalitarian regimes (Nazism, Fascism, Communism) in the 20th century to being multicultural. These regimes were threatened by diversity such as ethnic, social, and cultural diversity, causing states to wipe out entire groups of people to fulfill this ideology. In this connection, Rose argues that present day Europe is by and large democratic but faces a new challenge: How to handle multicultural challenges. His main argument is that societies should not exercise ‘verbal hygiene’, since it may have massive negative consequences for freedom of speech.</p>	<p>Kbh Jyllands-Postens Forlag.</p>
<p>Essays on hate speech with minorities as targets.</p>	<p>This book consists of a collection of different essays from differing perspectives on hate speech. The book starts with examples of hate crime and then connects such crimes to definitions of hate speech and potential legal consequences of such speech. Examples are drawn from various genres (e.g., literary texts, political speeches, and advertisements) and conflict situations around the world, including ethnic conflicts (e.g., in the USA, Israel, Bosnia, Serbia, Croatia, Hungary, and South Africa). These perspectives are accompanied by examples from a more local Danish context. Some examples of hate speech include statements made by Danish politicians, who primarily voice right-wing ideologies in the Danish immigration debate, such as Inger Støjberg, Mogens Camre, Søren Krarup, Lars Hedegaard, and Pia Kjærsgaard. Parrallels are also drawn between anti-semitic and anti-muslim rhetoric, and examples of dehumanizing rhetoric directed towards Muslims are also included in the book. In addition, examples also constitute anti-semitic viewpoints expressed in Denmark in the 1930s, and more recent anti-semitic opinions and speech voiced by Hizb-ut-Tahrir. The argument is put forth that combatting hate speech is not necessarily the same as limiting freedom of speech.</p>	<p>Larsen, Rune Engelbreth, Jens Lohmann og Klaus Slavensky (eds) (2013). Hate speech: fra hadetale til hadesyn København Informations Forlag 2013.</p>
<p>Function of blasphemy for Danish social identity</p>	<p>By challenging or scorning what has been thought of as the sacred core of society, the blasphemer has been historically seen as the societal other. In contemporary Denmark, however, the perception of the blasphemer has changed. In this article, I argue that the study of parliamentary debates about the future of the blasphemy provision in Danish penal law over the last one hundred years shows that the blasphemy provision is a ‘floating signifier’ which has been re-appropriated to fit different political goals and</p>	<p>Larsen, Signe Engelbrecht (2014). Towards the Blasphemous Self: Constructing Societal Identity in Danish Debates on the Blasphemy Provision in the Twentieth and Twenty-first Centuries. In: Journal of</p>

	<p>societal identity constructions. In the last 40 years, Denmark has been the scene of two international and high-profile diplomatic crises relating to blasphemous acts (in the 1970s and in the 2000s). In the current political climate, these crises are articulated as constituents of the cultural history of Denmark and being blasphemous is, accordingly, no longer linked to alterity, but rather inscribed in what might be referred to as ‘the societal self’.</p>	<p>Ethnic and Migration Studies nr. vol.40 iss.2, 1- 2</p>
<p>Relationship between freedom of expression and expression of hate in the Danish legal perspective</p>	<p>This book focuses on the dilemma between freedom of speech and consideration for others' feelings and dignity and the accompanying legal criminal liability. The book consists of a number of articles, in which several themes are explored such as defamation of honor, crimes directed towards public servants, attacks on freedom of speech vs. limitations for prosecution, and cartoonists vs. blasphemy. The author also provides a historical perspective on court cases.</p>	<p>Greve, V. 2008. Bånd på hånd og mund – strafforfølgelse eller ytringsfrihed? København: Jurist- og Økonomiforbundets Forlag</p>
<p>Freedom of expression in the context of the Mohammed cartoons</p>	<p>This article explores the many components of the Danish cartoon controversy in an attempt to understand what really happened and has been happening in Denmark since late 2005. Part I accounts for the genesis of the cartoon controversy, and Part II discusses the legal framework for the controversy – both in Denmark and internationally. Part III investigates the Danish Director of Public Prosecution’s decision not to bring criminal proceedings in response to the cartoons’ publication. Finally, Part IV examines the emphasis placed on freedom of expression in both the Danish and international arenas.</p>	<p>Lagoutte, S. 2008. “The Cartoon Controversy in Context: Analyzing the Decision Not to Prosecute Under Danish Law.” Brooklyn Journal of International Law 33 (2): 379–403.</p>
<p>Relationship between freedom of expression and hate speech</p>	<p>The issue of racist or hate speech engages both Article 10 and Article 17 of the European Convention on Human Rights. The early admissibility decisions of the Commission, invoking Article 17 alone, or Article 10 in conjunction with Article 17, reflected a confused understanding of the relationship between the provisions. The Lehideux and Isorni vs France (1996) judgement of the European Court of Human Rights clarified that Article 17 applies only in the context of Holocaust denial and related questioning of historical facts, and as a result, racist or xenophobic speech against minorities is protected under Article 10(1) of the Convention. The article asks whether all racist speech should find protection under Article</p>	<p>Keane, David (2007). Attacking Hate Speech under Article 17 of the European Convention on Human Rights. Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights 25/4, 641-664.</p>

	10(1), interference being allowed only when balanced against the conditions of Article 10(2); or whether all such speech should be condemned and attacked under Article 17 The philosophical arguments and legal implications of both approaches are analyzed. Finally, the desire to protect criticism of religion at the European level is explored in the context of the 'Danish cartoons' controversy and the evolving meaning of the term 'hate speech'.	
Relationship between (national) social norms and national hate speech law-making/law enforcement	Hate speech laws and legislation in Europe are designed and enforced in order to overcome “excessive social and economic disparities” (“achieving freedom through certain restrictions on freedom”).	Heinze, Eric (2009). Wild-West Cowboys Versus Cheese-Eating Surrender Monkeys: Some Problems in Comparative Approaches to Hate Speech. In James Weinstein & Ivan Hare (eds) EXTREME SPEECH AND DEMOCRACY, Chapter 10, pp. 182-203, Oxford University Press.
“The gender equality discourse and the freedom of speech discourse are combined to construct racialising notions of Muslims and nationalised liberal identities” for Denmark and Finland in public discourse	The ‘crisis of multiculturalism’ discourse characterizes the current political and media debates in many European countries. This paper analyses how liberal arguments, especially gender equality and freedom of speech, are used to promote nationalist and racialising political agendas in Denmark and Finland. It detects the powerful emergence of a nationalist rhetoric, based on the ‘politics of reversal’ and a re-articulation of liberal notions, in the Nordic countries, which have been known for their collectivist welfare state models and commitments to social equality. Through an analysis of case studies in both countries, the paper shows how debates about gendered violence in Muslim families turn into attempts to broaden the discursive space for racialising speech and to individualize racism.	Suvi Keskinen (2012) Limits to Speech? The Racialised Politics of Gendered Violence in Denmark and Finland, Journal of Intercultural Studies, 33:3, 261-274, DOI: 10.1080/07256868.2012.673470
Usefulness of hate speech and blasphemy laws in Denmark	In the Prophet Muhammad cartoon controversy, Denmark found that its hate speech and blasphemy statutes were laws of unintended consequences: they imposed on its government a burden that was both unnecessary, unwise and disastrous. In its efforts to maintain a legal arsenal enabling it to censor racial or religious insults, Denmark paid a very steep price. Without the laws, the controversy would likely have remained local, non-governmental and containable. The very existence of the laws	Winfield, Richard N. (2006). An Editorial Controversy Metastasizing: Denmark’s Hate Speech Laws. Communications Lawyer, Vol. 24, Number 1.

	caused a local controversy to metastasize into a global religious-governmental crisis.	
Denmark's hate speech laws and legislation by the example of the Mohammed cartoons	Danish concepts of <i>Hygge</i> (cosiness) and <i>folkelighed</i> (folksiness) are contrasted with hate speech in relation to the Mohammed cartoons.	Kahn, Robert A. (2009). Flemming Rose, the Danish Cartoon Controversy, and the New European Freedom of Speech. <i>California Western International Law Journal</i> 40, 253-290
Free speech vs hate speech by the example of the Danish cartoon controversy	In this publication, focus is placed on an aspect of the controversy that has not received extensive attention: the legal question of whether any of the images that were published to uphold free speech qualify as hate speech punishable under European law. There are three basic positions in this discussion. Many Muslim leaders think that at least some of these images were illegal hate speech. Muslim clerics in Denmark and France brought lawsuits against the <i>Jyllands-Posten</i> and the satirical magazine <i>Charlie Hebdo</i> for publishing these images. They viewed them as blasphemous, offensive, insulting, degrading, and as likely to stir up hatred or promote discrimination. For these Muslim leaders, these images are a form of hate speech that contravenes the law. Hard-core liberals could not disagree more. Academics like Randall Hansen and Brendan O'Leary and journalists like Christopher Hitchens and Philip Gourevitch argue that there is no right in liberal democracies not to be offended (Modood et al. 2006). 1 They also believe that anyone who insists upon this right is antiliberal and shows a fundamental misunderstanding of the importance of free speech. There is a variation on this position that encompasses scholars like Robert Post and Steven Heyman who are not hard-core Millian liberals, but who base their stance on the assumption that these cartoons were legitimate criticisms of religious doctrine rather than targeted attempts to stir up hatred against Muslims as an ethnoracial group (Heyman 2008 : 181–182; Post 2007). Of course, as Geoffrey Brahm Levey and Tariq Modood rightly point out, it is possible to interpret these cartoons as attacking both Islam-as-doctrine and Muslims-as-group—these are not mutually exclusive positions (2009 , 429). The third prominent position might be called multiculturalism without teeth. Scholars like Tariq Modood, Joseph	Bleich, E. (2012). Free speech or hate speech. The Danish cartoon controversy in the European legal context. In Khory, Kavita R. (ed.). <i>Global Migration. Challenges in the Twenty-First Century</i> . New York: Plgrave Macmillan, 113-128.

	<p>Carens, David Cesarani, and Mary Matsuda have argued that it was inappropriate to publish these cartoons, but that it was not an actionable offense (Modood et al. 2006). Modood captures the spirit of this position by suggesting that these images should be censured, not censored (4). This perspective rests on the assumption that these cartoons provoked deep offense, which is morally but not legally wrong, and which should, therefore, be punished through social tactics of condemnation rather than through court proceedings. No prominent body of scholarship has made the case that any of these images were illegal. The dividing line over whether any of these images constitutes actionable hate speech has thus been drawn between “radical Muslim clerics” and “everybody else.” I argue that this line is drawn in the wrong place.</p>	
--	---	--

Greece

Objectives	Brief abstracts (what do they say)	Bibliography reference
General overview of hate crimes in Greek penal law	Description of the basic elements of a hate crime according to the Greek Penal Law. The motive of hatred. The characteristics protected by legislation against hate crimes are race, color, religion, genealogical origin, national or ethnic origin, sexual orientation, gender identity or disability.	Voulgaris, Georgios. Hate crimes, (Poiniki Dikaiosini) 6/2010, p. 711
Relationship between freedom of expression and hate speech	Comment on The “Plevris acquittal” (Decision 3/2010 Supreme Civil and Penal Court – Άρειος Πάγος) concerning the acquittal of an author for hate speech. The commenter disagrees with the Court decision and finds that many of the expressions used by the author are extremist, hate provoking and cannot be considered as a simple opinion or even a scientific critic. However the commenter thinks that other judgments of the Court decision, such as the importance of freedom of speech and the fact that Law 727/1979 should be interpreted narrowly to protect freedom of expression are in accordance with Strasbourg jurisprudence.	Mallios, Vaggelis. Freedom of speech and racist speech. The “Plevris acquittal” (Decision 3/2010 Supreme Civil and Penal Court – Άρειος Πάγος) and the Strasbourg jurisprudence. (Note on Decision 3/2010 Supreme Civil and Penal Court – Άρειος Πάγος). (Dikaio Meson Mazikis Enimerosis) 2010, p. 397
Relationship between prohibition of	This publication focuses on the criminalization of “hate speech”. According to the article every such criminalization of hate speech should be focusing	Morozinis, Ioannis. Prohibition of discrimination and freedom of

<p>discrimination and freedom of expression.</p>	<p>on the legal rights that are threatened just as it is the case in hate crimes in general. As far as the simple denial of historical facts is concerned (the so - called historical revisionism), it cannot be criminalized because such a criminalization is against Greek Constitution (Article 14 par. 1 – protection of freedom of speech and expression) and because Framework Decision 2008/913/JHA does not include any such obligation for the national legislator.</p>	<p>expression – An interpretative approach of articles 1 par.1, 2 Law 927/1979 de lege lata and de lege ferenda concerning Decision 3/2010 Supreme Civil and Penal Court – Άρειος Πάγος and Framework Decision 2008/913/JHA. Poinika Hronika Ξ/2010 p.446.</p>
<p>Racist manifestations as crimes and their relationship to freedom of speech</p>	<p>This publication focuses on the conditions for the penalization of racist manifestations and the balance that need to be done between the protection of the public order against racist manifestations on one hand and freedom of speech on the other. According to this article the denial of the Holocaust should not be punished by hate crime provisions, as such an absolute prohibition of an opinion different to the recognition of these crimes would violate freedom of speech.</p>	<p>Simeonidou Kastanidou, E. Racist manifestations and freedom of speech. Poinika Hronika, ΞΓ/2013, p.481</p>
<p>Hate crime in Greece in the years of economic and social crisis</p>	<p>This publication tries to define hate crime as a type of crime that is different from other types of crime because of its motives and of the impact of the crime on both persons and society as a whole. Furthermore it focuses on the increasing amount of hate crimes in Greece in the years of economic crisis and finds that this increase mirrors issues like the migration, human rights and values of Democracy in modern Greece and therefore in Greece it is not enough to have a strict hate crime legislation, but there should be policies that will make hate crimes more “visible” to society.</p>	<p>Halkia, Anastasia. Racist hate crimes in crisis Greece: from victimization to the insult of Democracy. Egklimatologia, 1 / 2 -2013, p. 80</p>
<p>Racist speech according to new Greek Law 4285/2014 and its relationship to freedom of speech and expression.</p>	<p>According to this article, the new Greek “antiracist Law” 4285/2014 is very clear as far as the legal rights to be protected by antiracist laws (life, freedom and physical integrity.). Through public order there are other legal rights that are protected, such as the rights of minorities. According to the article the new provisions of Law 4285/2014 which amended Law 727/1979 do not disproportionately restrict the right to freedom of expression. Finally the crimes concerning the so- called historical revisionism are only meant to protect the public order and therefore infringe the right to freedom of speech and scientific research.</p>	<p>Vasmatzidis, Christos. Racist speech criminalization and the right to security. Constitutional matters. (And a short approach to legal right theories). Epitheorisis Dimosiou Dikaiou kai Dioikitikou Dikaiou Vol. 59, Issue 1, January – March 2015, p. 22</p>

<p>General overview of hate crimes in Greek penal law.</p>	<p>Description of the basic elements of a hate crime according to the Greek Penal Law. The motive of hatred. The characteristics protected by legislation against hate crimes are race, color, religion, genealogical origin, national or ethnic origin, sexual orientation, gender identity or disability. The denial of historical facts such as the Holocaust cannot be considered as a hate crime.</p>	<p>Voulgaris, Georgios. Hate crimes and their penal approach in Greece. Poiniki Dikaiosini, Issue 185, p. 275</p>
<p>Internet as a way to incite hatred, intolerance and violence against minorities in Greece.</p>	<p>This publication focuses on the internet as a threshold of hate speech diffusion in Greece. This hate speech refers mostly to immigrants, Muslims, Roma, Jews, gay and transgender persons. According to Law 4285/2014 the public incitement – either orally or through the press or Internet – to violence or hatred or any other act of discrimination against a person or a group of persons in a way that threatens public order or their life, freedom and their body integrity, for the sole reason of their identification in reference to a certain race, color, religion, genealogical origin, national or ethnic origin, sexual orientation, gender identity or disability is a criminal offence. The author of the article finds that it is necessary to investigate whether this public speech is likely to pose an immediate risk on the society and on the rights of the affected person or group.</p>	<p>Igglezakis, Ioannis. Internet hate speech and its criminal handling with L. 4285/2014, Sinigoros, Issue 109, May – June 2015, p. 109</p>
<p>Analysis of hate crime and hate speech according to Law 4285/2014 and in relation to freedom of speech.</p>	<p>This article analyzes the Law 4285/2014 that punishes the hate crimes in general, common criminal offences that have a hate motive, but also hate speech. As far as the latter is concerned the ECtHR demands a balance concerning the right to freedom of speech. According to the author, Greek “antiracist law” 4285/2014 disproportionately extends the freedom of speech without taking into consideration human dignity that is affected by hate speech. For the author human dignity is the legal right protected by “antiracist provisions” and hate crimes are targeting the foundations of Democracy.</p>	<p>Papacharalambous, Haris, Legislating hate. The example of “antiracist” Law 4285/2014. Available at: http://www.poinikachronika.gr/Epikaira_focus.asp?id=938#</p>
<p>Essays on free speech, hate speech, censorship and blasphemy after Charlie Hebdo attacks</p>	<p>This book consists of different essays from different perspectives on hate speech, censorship and blasphemy that have been written after the Charlie Hebdo attacks.</p>	<p>Christopoulos, Dimitris (eds). “Everything can be said” or are there “those that cannot be said”? VIVLIORAMA (2015).</p>

	<p>The essays focus on freedom of speech and the limits of satire and whether freedom of expression must be restricted after the Charlie Hebdo attacks, they inevitably discuss the matter of the “clash of civilisations” , the presence of Islam in Europe and the islamophobia as a form of racism.</p>	
--	--	--

Italy

Objectives	Brief abstracts (what do they say)	Bibliography reference
<p>Dealing with the evolution of equal rights for the LGBT people abroad and in Italy. The current status of LGBT rights in Italian politics and the influence of the Catholic church</p>	<p>A journey through judicial cases from the western world which have brought freedom to LGBT people from being classified as criminals or perverts to becoming political subjects. The book comes of age as the jurisdiction itself of most countries progresses, dealing with civil unions (or same-sex unions), marriage and same-sex parenthood. The author carries on a special focus analysis on Italy.</p>	<p>Matteo Maria Winkler, Gabriele Strazio. <i>L'abominevole diritto. Gay e lesbiche, giudici e legislatori.</i> , 2011</p>
<p>Outlining the bitter situation of the LGBT community in Italy nowadays, analyzing the political attitude as well as the social and religious influences</p>	<p>Homophobia, with Foucault's words, is a device and it's constantly examined through all the social sciences: law, anthropology, philosophy, history and psychoanalysis. Only through this process it is possible to carry on a deconstruction of Homophobia. The hatred against gays and lesbians is a phenomenon which develops throughout modern history and ideology and its ideals are being challenged by the author in this book.</p>	<p>Daniel Borrillo. <i>Omofobia. Storia e critica di un pregiudizio.</i> <u>Dedalo</u>, 2009</p>
<p>Hate speech and how to tackle this phenomenon and its relations with the freedom of thought/speech</p>	<p>The book deals with the hate speech, a hot topic and one of the worst forms of intolerance and racism as well as a growing global phenomenon. After reviewing the main jurisdictions and Sets of rules, especially focusing on Europe and its history (mainly Germany and Italy) and America's, the author carries on the hypothesis of considering instigation of hatred and racial discrimination as the worst manifestation of human thought. Eventually the author tries to identify common ways of tackling this problem by respecting dignity and equality. Section 2 of the book focuses only on Italy.</p>	<p>Lucia Scaffardi, <i>Oltre i confini della libertà di espressione : l'istigazione all'odio razziale</i>, Padova CEDAM, 2009</p>

<p>Through the analysis of some Italian cases the author tries to report the evolution of Italian legislature and how to keep defense of freedom of expression.</p>	<p>Racial Hate speech represents one of the burning issues within the protection of freedom of speech and thought. Through the analysis of some Italian cases the author tries to report the evolution of Italian legislature and how to keep defense of freedom of expression.</p>	<p>Palmina Tanzarella, <i>Il discorso d'odio razziale. Le tappe legislative e giurisprudenziali di un discutibile reato costituzionalmente protetto</i> found in: <i>Diritto, immigrazione e cittadinanza</i> : rivista trimestrale / promossa dall'Associazione per gli studi giuridici sull'immigrazione e Magistratura democratica , A. 11, n. 4 (ottobre-dicembre 2010), PP. 50-70</p>
<p>Analysis of racial hatred cases due to religious/ethnic reasons.</p>	<p>The book is a collection of different texts analysing current cases of discrimination with penal and constitutional relevance. Its contributions come from intellectuals and professionals dealing with religious discrimination within the Muslim community, racial hatred, ethnic discrimination within the armed forces.</p>	<p>Silvio Riondato, <i>Discriminazione razziale, xenofobia, odio religioso: diritti fondamentali e tutela penale</i>, Università degli studi di Padova CEDAM 2006</p>
<p>Comparison of laws and actions concerning religious hatred within three E.U. countries: IT, UK, FR</p>	<p>The book analyses and compares the jurisdictions of three main European countries: Italy, U.K., France especially concerning religious hatred, the limits and abuses of freedom of expression and the possibility of a European common model.</p>	<p>Anna Gianfreda, <i>Diritto penale e religione tra modelli nazionali e giurisprudenza di Strasburgo (Italia, Regno Unito e Francia)</i>, Università cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Giuffrè editore</p>
<p>Thorough sociological Analysis of web pages with hate speeches and incitement to ethnic/religious violence</p>	<p>The author, who sets out its work as a sociological analysis, gets deep into searching websites which could promote violence and racial hatred . As he comes across the worst scenario of 'killing negroes', anti-Semitic speeches and neo-Nazi racial superiority webpages, he blends the research with his memories and tries to give the readers a possible discussion topic.</p>	<p>Antonio Roversi, <i>L'odio in rete: siti ultras, nazifascismo online, jihad elettronica</i>, Il Mulino, Bologna 2006</p>
<p>Analysis of Italian vs. E.U jurisdiction concerning racism and xenophobia (especially focusing on online hate speech)</p>	<p>The author describes and analyses Italian jurisprudence on crimes based on racism, ethnic and/or religious hatred comparing it with the EU laws within the broader frame of immigration laws.</p>	<p>Teresa Maria Moschetta, <i>La decisione quadro 2008/913/GAI sulla repressione penale del razzismo e della xenofobia: una "occasione persa" per l'Italia?</i> found in: <i>G.Caggiano I percorsi giuridici per l'integrazione, migranti e titolari di protezione internazionale tra diritto dell'Unione e ordinamento italiano</i>. Giappichelli editore 2014</p>

<p>Describing the need for a law in Italy against hate crimes based on sexual orientation and what is the main consideration on this topic among high school students in Rome.</p>	<p>The authors describe the outcomes of a study and survey carried out in Roman secondary schools on the topic of Homophobia and prejudice against LGBT people. Within the text an analysis focuses on the lack in Italian law of any punishment against hate crimes based on sexual orientation as well as the lack of recognition of same-sex unions.</p>	<p>Francesca Aureli and Sergio Mauceri, <i>Media, Élite simboliche e omofobia: tra agire comunicativo e pratico</i>. Found in: <i>Omofobia come costruzione sociale. Processi generative del pregiudizio in età adolescenziale</i>, Franco Angeli edizione 2015</p>
<p>Comparative analysis of Religious hatred-based crimes in the U.S., India, U.K. and Italy</p>	<p>The Globalization of religious hatred. Phenomenological data analysis of Hate speech and hate crime and their dimension in today's media. After the analysis on US, Indian and British soil, the author describes Italy's case on the incitement to religious hatred between legislation and jurisprudence.</p>	<p>Cristiana Cianitto, <i>L'incitamento all'odio religioso: Stati Uniti, India, Gran Bretagna e Italia</i>, Giappichelli editore 2012</p>
<p>Comparative analysis of Homophobia and the laws to tackle it in the E.U. and the action of the European Court of Human rights.</p>	<p>The European Court of human rights and its analysis on the rise of Homophobia in Europe, the main legislative procedures in the E.U. countries, lights and shadows on the topic and actions against hate speech and Homophobia.</p>	<p>Luciana Gioisis, <i>Liberta d'espressione e odio omofobico. La Corte europea dei diritti dell'uomo equipara la discriminazione in base all'orientamento sessuale alla discriminazione razziale</i>. Found in: <i>Rivista italiana di diritto e procedura penale</i>, Vol. 56, N° 1, 2013</p>
<p>The thin line between freedom of expression and hate crime, especially through the internet (facebook)</p>	<p>The right to free thinking/expression and the principles of equality and same dignity of all humans share a very thin border within the subject of incitement and hatred based on race/ethnicity/sexual orientations and religion. The author analyses some cases of hate speech incitement through the web and especially through Facebook.</p>	<p>Chiara Silva, <i>Quando la discriminazione razziale si trasferisce su Facebook</i>, found in: <i>Archivio Penale rivista di diritto e procedura e legislazione penale</i>. settembre–dicembre 2012 fascicolo 3 anno LXIV</p>
<p>Outlining what Hate crime and Hate speech are and its acknowledgement in the Italian Constitution</p>	<p>What is hate crime and its relation to freedom of expression and thought. the linguistic features of a hate speech and opinion crimes.</p>	<p>Andrea Pugiotto, <i>Le parole sono pietre? I discorsi di odio e la libertà di espressione nel diritto costituzionale</i>, found in: <i>Diritto penale contemporaneo</i> 3/2013</p>

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
<p>To consider the issue of intolerance in Lithuania</p>	<p>Intolerance became one of global problems in the contemporary world. It based on neglecting and restraining cultural differences of individuals. This introductory article addresses the following question: is this problem relevant to Lithuania, and may Lithuania be characterised as intolerant state. The author stresses, that in circumstances of developing intolerance to certain ethnic and religion groups, it is extremely important how researchers, experts, politics, and government react to manifestations of contemporary extremisms. The article indicates essential factors influencing relationships between social groups in international society and delivers strategies that may be used in order to stop extremism. At the end, the author presents an overview of ethnic discrimination in Lithuania based on data of the monitoring of ethnic intolerance conducted in 2000-2005. The information collected allows taking a look at manifestation of intolerance in occupation, accommodation, legal, and education sectors as well as discussing violent intolerance. The article underlines that one of the most main strategies resisting to the extremism is taking remedies at governmental level, including legal prosecution of extremists.</p>	<p>Kasatkina N. 2006. Visuomenės nuostatų dichotomija: tolerancija versus nepakantumas? // <i>Etniškumo studijos 2006/1: Etninis nepakantumas/Ethnicity Studies 2006/1: Ethnic Intolerance</i>. Vilnius: Socialinių tyrimų institutas/Eugrimas, p. 7-18.</p> <p>ISSN 1822-1041</p>
<p>To demonstrate how the phenomenon of 'neo-racism' is represented in Lithuanian public discourse (media)</p>	<p>The article deals with the concept of race and racism and forms of their manifestation in modern society, with the focus on manifestations of racism in public discourse. Different approaches to analyzing racism in public discourse are presented. Also, by giving examples from Lithuanian media, the universality of "neo"-racism definition and the influence of the mass media in creating and reproducing racial and ethnic stereotypes and prejudices are discussed.</p>	<p>Frėjutė-Rakauskienė M. 2006. Contemporary Phenomenon of Racism and its Manifestations in Public Discourse// <i>Filosofija. Sociologija</i>. Lietuvos mokslų akademijos leidykla, Nr. 4, p. 13-19. ISSN 0235-7186. (Šiuolaikinio rasizmo</p>

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
		fenomenas ir jo apraiškos viešajame diskurse)
To show how the study of internet comments may reveal the manifestation of ethnic intolerance in on-line media	Freedom of the press and word in democratic state as well as presentation of news are directly linked with social responsibility, integration and development of tolerance. However society-based discussions regarding discrimination of ethnic groups, manifestations of ethnic intolerance in mass media occur in line with searching of effective ways to prevent racism, xenophobia and other forms of ethnic intolerance available in the internet. Activity of mass media is being regulated on the basis of laws, legal norms and norms of professional regulation. Websites of internet mass media and comments is new glance towards public discourse. Multimedia, interactive and free internet mass media is the specific area sensible for manifestations of ethnic intolerance. Subject of the research is phenomenon of ethnic intolerance. Ethnic intolerance is a subject still ambivalently understood and assessed, and manifestations of intolerance available in comments of news websites only recently gained attention of society and the mass media itself. The study of comments of article introduced in this study focuses on spread of manifestations of ethnic intolerance in the internet.	Auškalnienė, L. 2006. Etninis nepakantumas Lietuvos internetinėje žiniasklaidoje : komentarai internete. <i>Etniškumo studijos</i> . 2006, Nr.1. p. 45-58.
To examine the depiction of ethnic minorities, refugees, immigrants and other groups and ethnic issues in the	The article examines the depiction of ethnic minorities, refugees, immigrants and other groups and ethnic issues in the Lithuanian media, revealing the main stereotypes of ethnic minority groups. Using the classification of the forms of ethnic intolerance in mass media, the article presents the generalised results of the monitoring of ethnic issues in the press performed by the Centre for Ethnic Research, as well as some	Beresnevičiūtė, V.; Frėjutė-Rakauskienė, M. 2006. Etninė tematika ir nepakantumas Lietuvos žiniasklaidoje : dienraščių analizė. <i>Etniškumo studijos</i> . 2006, Nr.1. p. 19-44.

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
Lithuanian media, revealing the main stereotypes of ethnic minority groups	<p>examples of ethnic intolerance and xenophobia in the Lithuanian press. The bulk of data consists of the press reports on ethnic topics in 2004, 2005, and 2006. The increasing flow of information on ethnic topics, which is dominated by relatively weaker forms of intolerance construction in the media (e.g., creating a negative image of a minority group by means of texts or mentioning an ethnic or religious group in a demeaning context), coincides with the strengthening of negative social attitudes and ethnic intolerance trends towards certain ethnic groups. The following ethnic and religious groups continue to be mentioned the most: the Russians, the Jews, the Gypsies (Roma), the Muslims, and immigrants. These minority groups are depicted in the press by attributing significant negative characteristics to them and by disregarding their actual problems. According to public opinion surveys, ethnic intolerance towards the Gypsies (Roma) remains the highest. The Lithuanian population's intolerance towards the Muslims and immigrant groups is also increasing in relation to the significantly intensifying media attention to these groups.</p>	
To explore the trajectories of anti-Semitic imagination and the dynamics of anti-Semitic politics in modern Lithuania	<p>Lithuania can take pride in its historical legacy of ethnical, religious and cultural diversity during the time of the Grand Duchy of Lithuania and the Polish-Lithuanian Union. Modern Lithuania departed from this tradition, turning into an increasingly homogenous political actor in the age of nationalism. However, the new Lithuanian state offered Jews extensive cultural autonomy from 1918 to 1926. The Second World War and the Holocaust caused the complete destruction of the Litvak community and culture. Anti-Semitism in Soviet Lithuania never differed significantly from official policies, adopted by the Kremlin. Some characteristically Lithuanian</p>	<p>Donskis, L. 2006. Another word for uncertainty : anti-semitism in modern Lithuania. <i>Nordeuropa forum</i>. 2006, Iss. 1. p. 7-26.</p>

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
	<p>traits of anti-Semitism emerged within conservative and chauvinistic émigré circles. Yet the country was to revive the full scale of prejudice and hatred after 1990. This article explores the trajectories of anti-Semitic imagination and the dynamics of anti-Semitic politics in modern Lithuania.</p>	
<p>To analyze the reporting and portrayal of Roma in Lithuanian media and to show how the rhetoric of violence and Othering is implemented</p>	<p>This article analyses the reporting and portrayal of Roma, the representations examined are predominantly from articles in the Lithuanian press, in 2005–2006. These years were marked by an intensive flow of information on Roma issues and the database compiled from this information provides the author with an opportunity to apply quantitative analysis of the content of the media reports that is based on minority or media-analytical perspectives. From the evidence taken from different data sources, this article discusses dynamic and subject-matter changes of the constructed images of the Roma people. It is argued that within the dominating speech scheme, Roma are defined as an "other" group (usually as an external evil) that is distinct in its cultural norms, life style and other characteristics. Roma thus become an impersonal group that is portrayed as a "loudly chattering / loudly twittering / loudly shouting" entity – despite being considered a voiceless agent – and an unreliable part of a dialogue, which is involved in exclusively negative activities (criminal behaviour, drug-dealing, threatening to society's security, being unreliable neighbours, etc.). The categories ascribed to Roma, and reoccurring in press reports, represent a rhetoric of violence that discloses discursive power relations: the content of the reports is homogenous, controlled and generates recognisable definitions in social knowledge and structure of social relations that determine fear, anxiety, hostility, hatred and a high level of social</p>	<p>Beresnevičiūtė V. 2010. Prievartos retorika prieš visuomenės nebyliusius: Lietuvos spaudos tekstų apie romus analizė. <i>Etniškumo studijos 2010/1-2</i>. LSTC/ Eugrimas, p. 86-104.</p>

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
	<p>distance towards Roma and transforms social interactions correspondingly. The rhetoric of violence instigates an atmosphere of fear that is reflected in the negative public attitudes towards Roma, and society constructs images that legitimate violence relations with Roma.</p>	
<p>To analyze the results of the comparative survey among German and Lithuanian youth which show the higher level of intolerance and homophobia among Lithuanians.</p>	<p>The article analyses the problem of intolerance while comparing Lithuania and Germany, the peculiarities of its spread among youngsters, and justifies the significance of social work while solving problems of intolerance. In order to find out the extent of intolerance spread among Lithuanian and German students and analyse the personal experience of respondents in the field of violence and discrimination, a questionnaire survey was performed in Vilnius University and Leipzig University of Applied Sciences. A total of 171 students participated in the research (64 girls and 32 boys in Lithuania, 43 girls and 32 boys in Germany). The analysis of the obtained results has revealed that there is a great difference between Lithuanian and German students' attitudes with regard to discriminated groups of people. Lithuanians' intolerance towards representatives of other nations, homosexuals, Jews, homeless persons, Gypsies is manifold higher than Germans' attitudes. Lithuanian men are more homophobic and have more stereotypes with regard to the issue of gender equality than women do. In Germany, the difference between women and men with regard to issues of intolerance is very slight. The results of the research indicate the importance of social work in this field. Activities performed in Lithuania are not efficient enough and more formal. It does not actually reach the target group and bring obvious results in transforming the youth's attitudes. The peril of the phenomenon of intolerance is not estimated, and no measures are taken to</p>	<p>Bumblauskaitė, J.; Lepeškienė, V.; Paškauskaitė, A. 2007. Studentų netolerantiškų nuostatų tyrimas Lietuvoje ir Vokietijoje. Lyginamoji analizė. STEPP : socialinė teorija, empirija, politika ir praktika. 2007, Nr. 4. p. 96-103.</p>

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
	<p>prevent aggression and discrimination, therefore, it is very important to draw attention to tendencies prevailing among youngsters. The article indicates possible guidelines for social workers' activities aimed at decreasing intolerance.</p>	
<p>to examine in what forms and how ethnic intolerance is constructed in printed and Internet media texts through representation of topics, problems, named causers of the problems and their causality (i.e. by introducing/presenting explanations of causes of the problems)</p>	<p>The aim of this research is to analyze ethnic topics of Lithuanian press. The objective of the research is to examine in what forms and how ethnic intolerance is constructed in printed and Internet media texts through representation of topics, problems, named causers of the problems and their causality (i.e. by introducing/presenting explanations of causes of the problems). Therefore, the main problem of this study is the assessment of the concept of ethnic intolerance and measurement of ethnic intolerance in media discourse. The main body of empirical data was collected during the qualitative research of printed and Internet media, which consisted of two parts: (1) media content analysis and (2) structured interviews with experts (politicians, officials, representatives of ethnic minorities, and journalists). The findings of the research of ethnic intolerance content in Lithuanian media reveals that topics (problems) of interethnic relations in Lithuanian press are mostly interrelated with economical and political issues and less with cultural and psychological causality aspects. Each ethnic or religious group - Roma, Jews, Polish, Russians, Muslims and immigrants - is associated with specific problems in the Lithuanian press. No aggressive forms of ethnic intolerance (incitement to discrimination, hostility or violence) were found in the content of Lithuanian press. The most common manifestations of ethnic intolerance in Lithuanian press were hate speech, harassment, subtle (hidden) prejudices, stereotypes and the discourse of silence. The</p>	<p>Frejute-Rakauskiene, M. 2009. Etninio nepakantumo ir ksenofobijos apraiškos Lietuvos spaudoje ES prevencinės politikos aspektu. Dr. disert. (socialiniai m.) - Vilniaus universitetas.</p>

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
	<p>understanding of ethnic problems (topics) in Lithuanian society and representation of ethnic problems in Lithuanian press present a closed circulation cycle as the problems experienced by ethnic, religious and migrant groups in Lithuanian society and identified by surveyed experts, are partially reiterated from topics about ethnic groups covered in media.</p>	
<p>to analyze a possible influence of the media to the spread of ethnic intolerance</p>	<p>When Lithuania became a member of the European Union, the verbal expression of ethnic intolerance, i.e. ethnic intolerance and xenophobia in the public information, became topical. The issue of ethnic intolerance does not directly depend on the number of ethnic and other groups in a country or the legal framework that should ensure the principles of indiscriminate and equality. However, various cases of discrimination and racist attacks depend on the social environment in which they appear. In her study, the author analyses a possible influence of the media to the spread of ethnic intolerance. By means of a qualitative analysis of Lithuanian texts about interethnic relations, the main problems, themes, reasons of the problems and influencing factors are determined and the forms in which the ethnic intolerance is constructed in the texts of the media are distinguished. The data was accumulated by the analysis of the printed and on-line sources of the period of 2005–2007. The study also discusses general principles of the ethnic intolerance prevention in the whole European Union. The concepts of ethnic, racial intolerance and xenophobia that are found in the documents of the specialised institutions and other organisations in the EU territory that work in the field of racial intolerance prevention are analysed. After an analysis of legal means of the prevention of ethnic intolerance and xenophobia in the public space, the recommendations to improve the</p>	<p>Frėjutė-Rakauskienė, M. 2009. Etninis nepakantumas Lietuvos spaudoje. Etniškumo studijos. 2009, Nr. 1. p. 5-207.</p>

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
	<p>regulations and their application, to educate the society through the media and to encourage public debates about tolerance were provided.</p>	
<p>The article aims at identifying the tendencies of hate crime during the period of economic crisis in Lithuania.</p>	<p>The article defines the concept of hate crime for this research (chapter XXV of Lithuanian Criminal Code: crimes and misdemeanours against person's equal rights and freedom of conscience) and explains circumstances that encumber the establishment of the impact of economic factors on hate crime; analyses legal theories that list economic factors among the reasons of hate crime; identifies the dynamics of hate crime during the period of economic downturn in Lithuania and verifies whether the tendencies might have been influenced by other factors (amendments of regulation and structural reform). The analysis reveals that most legal theories (strain theory, theories of social disorganisation, resource competition) confirm the growth of hate crime during the period of economic recession: members of society usually have a negative attitude towards immigrants or other minorities as posing risk on social-economic stability and increasing competition in distribution of resources. Nevertheless, it is emphasized that the influence of economic crisis on the tendencies of hate crime is much more complex, existing on macro-level and on micro-level, where the manifestation of hate motivation in a particular person's behaviour depends on many factors, including the formation of prejudice, level of self-control, being unemployed and uneducated that are often related with poverty. Therefore one may come across a position that hate crime is not related with economic factors. Legal analysis finds that during the economic crisis the number of registered hate crime in Lithuania (mostly comprised of</p>	<p>Isokaitė, I. 2015. Impact of the economic downturn on hate crime tendencies. <i>Teisė</i>, 94, 189 - 203</p>

Objectives	Brief abstracts	Bibliography reference
	<p>incitement to hatred) has grown from some tenths to hundreds of such criminal offences per year. The author notices that the Criminal Code has been supplemented with several new criminal offences (public incitement to violence by publishing, distributing hate production, organising groups, also denial, trivialisation of international crimes, crimes of Soviet or Nazi regime), however, there are usually only few if any such criminal offences per year in practice. Thus neither the changes in regulation nor the reorganisation of a special unit in the General Prosecutor’s Office had any significant impact on the established growth of hate crime. Case law of Lithuanian courts, where statements inciting to violence are used in the context of economic crisis in Lithuania and negative attitude is expressed towards immigrants, national, sexual or other minorities, confirm that economic downturn intensifies hate prejudice. Finally, it is concluded that despite the identified growth of hate crime economic crisis is not the only or a direct cause of hate crime, still, undoubtedly it stands among the factors intensifying such type of crime (especially incitement to hatred). Attention is also paid to the fact that a ‘hate culture’ or a ‘hate phenomenon’ remains among the most complex challenges for states.</p>	

Malta

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliographical reference
<p>This report provides an overview of the major developments relating to human rights in Malta within the reporting period of January to December 2014.</p>	<p>2014 developments reported: the Civil Unions Bill, giving same-sex partners, through civil unions, the same rights that heterosexual couples have through marriage in all but name; the Valenzia Report, which heavily criticized Malta's detention policy and its services; and the beginning of an investigation against Leisure Clothing Ltd into allegations of human trafficking.</p>	<p>Cassar, C., & Gauci, J.-P. (2015). <i>The Malta Human Rights Report 2015</i>. Retrieved November 11, 2015, from: http://www.pfcmalta.org/malta-human-rights-report-2015.html</p>
<p>This document provides data about perceptions of discrimination in Malta for the Eurobarometer report requested by the Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers and issued in 2015.</p>	<p>This is a document, not a publication. The document is a factsheet containing all the data that was collected with regards to discrimination in Malta and used for the 2015 Eurobarometer report (also mentioned below).</p>	<p>European Commission. (2015). <i>Discrimination in the EU in 2015: EUROBAROMETER Malta Factsheet</i>. Retrieved November 11, 2015, from: http://ec.europa.eu/COMMFrontOffice/PublicOpinion/index.cfm/Survey/getSurveyDetail/instruments/SPECIAL/surveyKy/2077</p>
<p>This study aimed to understand the particular challenges that young migrants and asylum seekers from Africa say they face when living in Malta and attending</p>	<p>This study appraises the particular challenges that minor asylum-seeking migrants who are in the 16–18 age category confront when pursuing their studies in a vocational college in Malta. The study explores how they exercise resilience in their desire to forge a future for themselves and traces their passage from Africa to Malta and their prospective aspirations to eventually settle elsewhere. It also explores how they integrate their lives as college students with these aspirations and how they see this as contributing to their lifelong education and ongoing processes of personal growth.</p>	<p>Spiteri, D. (2015). Experiences of young (minor) asylum seekers in further education in Malta, <i>International Journal of Lifelong Education</i>, 34 (2), 156-171.</p>

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliographical reference
<p>the Malta College of Arts, Science and Technology (MCAST).</p>		
<p>This report presents the results from a new Eurobarometer survey on discrimination.</p> <p>(All EU countries, including Malta)</p>	<p>The 2015 survey repeats several questions asked in previous Eurobarometer surveys (2006, 2009, 2012) in order to provide insight into the evolution of perceptions, attitudes, knowledge and awareness of discrimination in the European Union. A number of new questions were added to further explore social acceptance of some groups at risk of discrimination.</p> <p>The report explores a number of issues including whether citizens think of themselves as belonging to a group at risk of discrimination and the diversity of their social circles; perceptions of discrimination, covering the perceived extent of discrimination in respondents' countries; personal attitudes toward different groups at risk of discrimination and representations of diversity in the media; and, in particular, the report puts a spotlight on attitudes towards LGBT (lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender) people, covering public attitudes towards sexual orientation and gender identity.</p>	<p>TNS Opinion & Social at the request of the Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers (DG JUST). (2015). <i>Special Eurobarometer 437: Discrimination in the EU in 2015 Report</i>. Retrieved November 11, 2015, from: http://www.equineteurope.org/Discrimination-in-the-EU-in-2015</p>
<p>This LGBTIQ Action Plan 2015 – 2017 aims to implement measure 06.010, which states that the government will strengthen policy initiatives aimed at combating discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation in the public service,</p>	<p>The national commitment towards equality for lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans, intersex and genderqueer persons in Malta requires concrete actions that lead to the enjoyment of all human rights and civil liberties regardless of sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics.</p> <p>The Government Programme made reference to a number of measures relevant to the LGBTIQ community – most of which have already been addressed. The LGBTIQ Action Plan 2015 – 2017 was formulated by the LGBTIQ Consultative Council in partnership with the Ministry for Social Dialogue, Consumer Affairs and Civil Liberties. It was then finalised following consultation meetings with relevant Ministries that will be leading on the implementation of the various actions.</p>	<p>Ministry for Social Dialogue, Consumer Affairs and Civil Liberties. (2015, July). <i>LGBTIQ Action Plan 2015-2017</i>. Retrieved November 23, 2015, from: https://socialdialogue.gov.mt/en/Documents/LGBTIQ%20Action%20Plan/LGBTIQ%20Action%20Plan%20lo%20res.pdf</p>

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliographical reference
including in the police force.		
This article analyses the social construction of island life, known as islandness. Exploring the interaction between islands and migration on the basis of the Maltese context	Although security has become a common framework for analysing dispositifs that aim to control irregular migration, island spaces themselves are seldom considered as security dispositifs. The case of Malta, where detention is mandatory upon arrival, epitomises what could be conceptualised as a “sentinel island” within the European Union. This article demonstrates how the interaction between political discourse, administrative practices, and migrants’ experiences contributes to turning the island into a form of total-institution setting. The empirical data is based on qualitative fieldwork that combines ethnographic observation, migrants’ individual narratives and semi-structured interviews conducted with European and national policy makers.	Lemaire, L. (2014). Islands and a Carceral Environment: Maltese Policy in Terms of Irregular Migration. <i>Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies</i> , 12 (2), 143-160.
This Report provides an opportunity to engage with existing data, as well as to identify lacunae in legislation, policy and research.	The experience of racism and inequality is an ongoing feature of the lives of minority groups in Malta. Despite legislation and policies protecting individuals from racism and discrimination, the experience of individuals and groups in social life as well as in the sphere of employment remains largely unaccounted for. The data used in this report is based on reported cases, rather than sweeping studies that adequately cover the population in a coherent and comprehensive manner.	Attard, S., Cassar, C., & Gauci, J.-P. (2014). <i>European Network Against Racism (ENAR) Shadow Report: Racism and related discriminatory practices in employment in Malta 2012-2013</i> . Retrieved November 11, 2015, from: http://www.pfcmalta.org/uploads/1/2/1/7/12174934/enar-sr2012-2013.pdf
This report examines the extent to which The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance’s (ECRI)	Since the publication of ECRI’s third report on Malta on 29 April 2008, progress has been made in a number of fields covered by that report. ECRI welcomed these positive developments in Malta. However, despite the progress achieved, some issues continue to give rise to concern. In this report, ECRI requests that the Maltese authorities take further action in a number of areas; in this context, it makes a series of recommendations.	Council of Europe. (2013). <i>The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance report on Malta (fourth monitoring cycle)</i> . Retrieved November 11, 2015, from: https://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitori

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliographical reference
<p>main recommendations from previous reports have been followed and includes an evaluation of policies adopted and measures taken.</p> <p>(All EU countries, including Malta)</p>		<p>ng/ecri/Country-by-country/Malta/MLT-CbC-IV-2013-037-ENG.pdf</p>
<p>This report outlines the findings of a delegation of the Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) that was sent to Malta from 26 to 30 September 2011, in pursuance of Article 7 of the European Convention.</p>	<p>The visit that this document reports on aimed at examining the current situation in the prison system, having regard to the recommendations made by the Committee after its 2008 visit to Malta. The delegation once again examined conditions in the detention centers for foreigners at Lyster and Safi Barracks. It also paid a brief visit to Mount Carmel Psychiatric Hospital, in order to interview patients in the forensic ward and the irregular migrants' ward.</p>	<p>Council of Europe. (2013, July 4). <i>Report to the Maltese Government on the visit to Malta carried out by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) from 26 to 30 September 2011</i>. Retrieved November 11, 2015, from: http://www.cpt.coe.int/documents/mlt/2013-12-inf-eng.htm</p>
<p>The report presents an overview of the major developments relating to human rights in Malta in</p>	<p>The year 2013 was marked by the threatened push back of sub-Saharan migrants to Libya, which was halted by the European Court of Human Rights; the MV Salamis incident of rescue at sea and the legal issues this stirred up; and the European Court of Human Rights's decisions regarding Malta's detention policy.</p>	<p>Attard, S., Cassar, C., & Gauci, J.-P. (2013). <i>The Malta Human Rights Report 2013</i>. Retrieved November 10, 2015, from: http://www.pfcmalta.org/uploads/1/</p>

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliographical reference
2013.		2/1/7/12174934/malta_human_rights_report_2013.pdf
This report seeks to highlight some of the key concerns about discrimination that have been discussed in previous years. It builds on previous reports and feeds off the ground experience of the authors and some 12 community leaders and NGO representatives, and covers the period between March 2011 and March 2012.	Many manifestations of racial and religious discrimination continued to be noted over the reporting period in various spheres of life including employment, education, housing, healthcare, media, political participation, access to goods and services and the criminal justice process. Instances of hate crimes were also reported.	Gauci, J-P. & Pisani, M.(2013) <i>European Network Against Racism (ENAR) Shadow Report: Racism and related discriminatory practices 2011-2012</i> . Retrieved December 15, 2015, from: http://www.enar-eu.org/IMG/pdf/malta-2.pdf
This report offers an NGO perspective on the realities of racism within Malta in 2010-2011.	Racism and racial discrimination continued to be prevalent within the Maltese context over the period under review. In different ways and to varying degrees, the lives of ethnic minorities in Malta were affected by prejudice and disadvantage. The aim of this report is to provide a snapshot of these issues as well as developments and positive initiatives that occurred between March 2010 and March 2011.	Gauci, J-P. (2012) <i>European Network Against Racism (ENAR) Shadow Report: Racism and related discriminatory practices 2010-2011</i> . Retrieved December 15, 2015, from: http://www.enar-eu.org/IMG/pdf/18_malta.pdf
This report presents the results from a	In 2012, the majority of respondents had friends or acquaintances from a different religion (67%, +3 percentage points since 2009) or from an ethnic	TNS Opinion & Social at the request of the Directorate-General Justice, the

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliographical reference
<p>Eurobarometer survey on discrimination. (All EU countries, including Malta)</p>	<p>origin different from their own (59%, +2 since 2009). Europeans were also increasingly accepting of diversity in the public sphere in 2012. Overall more Europeans said that they would feel comfortable rather than uncomfortable if a person from one of the minority groups analysed were to lead their country, and the proportions feeling “comfortable” have increased since 2009. However, there were large differences between countries, both in terms of social diversity and the acceptance of diversity in the public sphere, which are partly explained by demographic factors and/or cultural differences (particularly when it comes to accepting different sexual orientations).</p> <p>Looking at how perceptions of the prevalence of ethnic discrimination have evolved since 2009, the survey showed that in most countries the situation is thought to have improved. The largest improvement is noted in Malta, where the proportion thinking that ethnic discrimination is rare or non-existent has increased by 23 percentage points to 41%. Malta also saw a notable increase as a country that would feel comfortable if a person from a different ethnic majority held their country’s highest elected political position (from 4.4 to 5.4).</p>	<p>Directorate-General Communication. (2012). <i>Special Eurobarometer 393: Discrimination in the EU in 2012 Report</i>. Retrieved November 11, 2015, from: http://ec.europa.eu/public_opinion/archives/ebs/ebs_393_en.pdf</p>
<p>The main research question was “what factors inhibit people from reporting experiences and cases of discrimination to responsible bodies?”</p>	<p>This study was part of the <i>Strengthening Equality Beyond Legislation</i> project, mentioned in Annex 2. It assessed the extent to which discrimination in Malta goes unreported. Additionally, it involved exploring knowledge of what constitutes discrimination, awareness of rights and feelings of empowerment. It also sought to gauge trust in official anti-discrimination bodies and whether there is preference for reporting discrimination issues to outlets other than official bodies.</p>	<p>National Commission for the Promotion of Equality (NCPE). (2010). <i>Underreporting of Discriminatory Incidents in Malta - a research study</i>. Retrieved November 11, 2015, from: https://ncpe.gov.mt/en/Documents/Projects_and_Specific_Initiatives/Strengthening_Equality_Beyond_Legislation/underreporting.pdf</p>
<p>National Action Plan Against Racism and</p>	<p>This publication seeks to build upon and achieve the full potential of the legal framework that already exists with regards to racism as well as the</p>	<p>Equality Research Consortium. (2010, December). <i>National Action Plan</i></p>

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliographical reference
Xenophobia	<p>various initiatives that have been undertaken by a wide spectrum of stakeholders.</p> <p>Somewhat of a treatise, it sets forth a number of strategic objectives as well as specific initiatives to be achieved and implemented over the course of three years. Its need stems from the fact that despite efforts by various stakeholders, discrimination on the basis of race and ethnic origin remain widespread in Malta.</p> <p>The overarching aims of the plan are to: provide strategic direction to combat racism and xenophobia and to develop a more equal, inclusive and intercultural society. These aims are made operational through a number of strategic objectives to be achieved, as well as specific initiatives to be taken over a three-year period in the fields of employment, education and training, health and social services, housing, racist violence, media, and policing.</p>	<p><i>Against Racism and Xenophobia.</i> Retrieved November 11, 2015, from: http://www.pfcmalta.org/uploads/1/2/1/7/12174934/napar.pdf</p>

Malta Student dissertations in related areas (since 2010)

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliography reference
This thesis assesses the legal challenges presented by a changing media landscape that has given rise to new opportunities for freedom of expression, as well as for crime	This thesis demonstrates that there is no need for a rethink of traditional legal doctrine because technologically neutral laws can be applied to traditional crimes committed online. These legal norms withstand the test of time without requiring amendment in line with every new technological development. Nevertheless, it is evident that special attention ought to be paid when regulating online activity given the specific nature of the Internet as a tool for free speech and democracy.	Hilli, A. (2015). <i>The boundaries of freedom of expression on social media: regulating incitement to commit crimes and hate speech in an online environment.</i> Unpublished dissertation for the degree Doctor of Laws. University of Malta, Msida

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliography reference
<p>This research aims at understanding the Maltese feelings' towards LGBT tourists, to gather perceptions towards whether a specific LGBT tourism niche market could be properly considered for the Maltese Islands.</p>	<p>The research uncovered that although a majority of respondents were open to LGBT tourists, they felt that Malta was lacking in LGBT-friendly qualities when it comes to the tourism products and that the general attitudes of the Maltese population towards LGBT tourists are negative.</p>	<p>Desira, K. (2014). <i>Maltese and LGBT Tourists: Attitudes of Maltese towards Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender Tourism</i>. Unpublished dissertation for the degree Bachelor of Tourism Studies. University of Malta, Msida</p>
<p>The purpose of this dissertation is to explore state secondary school teachers' perceptions of multiculturalism in their classrooms. It investigates the general overview of Maltese teachers' perceptions of multicultural education.</p>	<p>The findings show that although teachers have a positive general outlook on multicultural education and are more culturally relevant as educators, the level of assimilationist tendencies is excessive. An inadequate number of teachers are willing to adapt their pedagogy to suit cultural diversity in classrooms, which they attribute to syllabi that are too focused, rigid and extensive. Further findings show that the majority of teachers: have no 'ideological clarity'; unconsciously create cultural dissonance in classrooms; are unaware of their race and power evasive discourse and fail to recognise their 'colour-blind approach' as latent racism.</p>	<p>Scicluna, M. (2013). <i>Multicultural Education in Maltese State Secondary Schools: Teachers' Perceptions</i>. Unpublished dissertation for the degree Bachelor of Education. University of Malta, Msida</p>

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliography reference
<p>This dissertation focuses on personal experiences that transgender people have been through and the victimisation of hate crimes or discrimination.</p>	<p>The findings suggest that there is variability in the levels of victimisation amongst transgender persons. Discrimination and hate crime incidents were reported by the participants in various forms and quantity.</p>	<p>Bugeja, A. (2011) <i>Transgender in Malta: victims of discrimination or hate crime?</i> Unpublished dissertation for the degree Bachelor of Arts Criminology. University of Malta, Msida</p>
<p>This dissertation is a qualitative study, which aims at exploring the living situation of coloured citizens in Malta and Gozo.</p>	<p>The data was obtained from in- depth interviews with four participants. The emergent themes were analysed through interpretative phenomenological approach. The study highlights the struggles that these coloured citizens went through their life, especially in Malta. They all showed a sense of resilience, some more than others. Their identity was challenged, built and strengthened through their life experience. The participants believe in having a better future made up of more inclusion and integration.</p>	<p>Debono, M. (2011). <i>The Lived Experience of Coloured Citizens in Malta</i>. Unpublished dissertation for the degree Bachelor of Psychology. University of Malta, Msida</p>
<p>This thesis aims at examining discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation in Malta due to the non-recognition of same-sex relationships.</p>	<p>The provisions of the Constitution of Malta dealing with fundamental rights and freedoms in addition to provisions from other Substantive legislation [at the time] did provide for non-discrimination irrespective of an individuals" sexual orientation. Nevertheless these did not provide protection and grant rights in respect of same-sex couples, whether registered or not. Subsequently a number of excerpts from Maltese legislation which discriminate against same-sex couples due to the non- recognition of their relationship are observed. In addition to including a brief summary of all the study, the conclusion aims at applauding the developments already undertaken by Malta in some aspects and at encouraging more progress as a way forward.</p>	<p>Magro, E. (2011). <i>Discrimination on the Basis of Sexual Orientation due to the Non-Recognition of Same-Sex Relationships, Selected Case Studies drawn from the Maltese Legislative Experience</i>. Unpublished dissertation for the degree Doctor of Laws. University of Malta, Msida</p>
<p>The purpose of this thesis is to examine</p>	<p>The research carried out in this thesis showed that Malta has an extensive legal framework in place for the protection against discrimination in the fields</p>	<p>Zanya Bugre, M. A. (2011). <i>Racial discrimination in Maltese law:</i></p>

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliography reference
<p>racial discrimination in Maltese law, and in light of current circumstances regarding migration in Malta, to determine whether Maltese law provides an adequate legal framework for protection against racial discrimination.</p>	<p>of civil, administrative, and criminal law, albeit incoherently placed in different laws and coupled with a somewhat deficient enforcement mechanism. In addition to the International Convention for the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD), Malta has ratified almost all international conventions prohibiting racial discrimination in the enjoyment of fundamental rights and freedoms but with reservations. Although these conventions are not directly enforceable in the Maltese courts, they are sources of law nonetheless, and are used by the courts as guide in their interpretation of cases before them.</p>	<p><i>does Maltese law provide adequate framework to combat racial discrimination?</i> Unpublished dissertation for the degree Doctor of Laws. University of Malta, Msida</p>
<p>This study sought to analyse the effect that the high number of incoming migrants (specifically migrants with refugee status) in Malta has on the xenophobic attitudes of Maltese citizens.</p>	<p>Most of the participants in this study scored quite high in xenophobic beliefs. Participants with lower levels of education and who perceived there to be a much higher population of immigrants scored much higher in xenophobic beliefs. This contrasted to the scores of people with higher levels of education. Xenophobic and racist beliefs were significantly correlated, showing that they tend to complement each other. When analysing the proximity of the participant to immigrants, in relation to the district they reside in, the results yielded were not significant. All together these findings suggest that economy, fear of losing one's nationality, and other particular characteristics in a person's social and personal life are likely to have an impact on their xenophobic beliefs.</p>	<p>Cutajar, R. (2010). <i>Prejudice towards immigrants in Malta: is xenophobia and issue?</i> Unpublished dissertation for the degree Bachelor of Psychology. University of Malta, Msida</p>
<p>This research was carried out in order to study the attitudes of</p>	<p>Results indicate that education on irregular immigration can bring about a change in attitudes, especially in students. The results also shed light on the importance of integration of irregular immigrants into the educational system</p>	<p>Mamo Portelli, S. (2010). <i>The attitudes of students and teachers towards irregular immigration: can education make a change?</i> .</p>

Objectives	Brief abstract	Bibliography reference
<p>students and teachers towards irregular immigration. The study also investigates the suitability of proposed educational plans in inspiring humanitarian attitudes as regards the issue.</p>	<p>since much of the learning occurred through direct interaction of the subjects with the refugee speaker.</p>	<p>Unpublished dissertation for the degree Bachelor of Education. University of Malta, Msida</p>
<p>This dissertation used a phenomenological model to examine the life experiences of ten young gay and lesbian people in an effort to understand the phenomenon of homophobia, investigate its dynamics and gives meaning to how it relates to their everyday life.</p>	<p>The life stories of the participants attest that the more the interviewees has control over their lives, the less they internalized homophobia. That is, the more the gay and lesbian individuals that took part in the study believed their lives were controlled by others, the more likely they associated and had internalized homophobia. For example, according to one respondent's opinion, gay people become their own enemies when they do not deal with who they are internally.</p>	<p>Vassallo, R. (2010). <i>Expressions of hatred</i>. Unpublished dissertation for the degree Bachelor of Arts Youth and Community Studies. University of Malta, Msida</p>

Romania

Objectives	Brief abstracts (what do they say)	Bibliography reference
<p>1. Analysis and concierge providing for politics in PROGRES domains UE;</p> <p>2. Monitoring and report the application of legislation and PROGRES politics domains;</p>	<p>Researches depicts that Roma remains the most discriminated group regarding racism, for the covered period 2009-2010. Prejudices against Roma continues to be consolidated by different channels, solidified to Roma`s general negative perception who are marginalized in society. Discrimination practices against Roma are not limited to hate speech or racist rhetoric`s, but, as well as, regarding the strident most of the people`s behaviour toward Roma.</p> <p>A significant number of Roma continues to migrate for medium and long periods in other countries from Western Europe. By their arrival in Romania most of these people face serious problems in accessing social services from Romania. Religious discrimination against the Greek-Catholic community was registered during the year. Anti-Semitic incidents were also recorded.</p> <p>Immigrants continue to be victims of marginalization in society and at the policy level.</p> <p>Roma are most exposed to discrimination in relation to employment. Empirical data seem to indicate an increase in racist motivated incidents and violence against Roma during 2009 compared to previous years.</p>	<p>ENAR Shadow Report 2009/2010 Racism and Discrimination in Romania</p> <p>http://www.enar-eu.org/IMG/pdf/romania-2.pdf</p>
<p>1. Monitoring the way some ethnical and religious groups are dicriminated in Romania;</p>	<p>The political and economic evolution from 2010 have facilitated the increasing tendencies of racism and discrimination.</p> <p>The main conclusions of the reports demonstrate that discrimination based on ethnical criteria was increasing in Romania. Roma, Hungarians and Jews are the most discriminated ethnicities.</p> <p>Decision-makers made discriminatory statements for political advantages during the reported period. Regarding Roma, discrimination has a background of poverty and social exclusion.</p> <p>Persons with disabilities and Roma are the most discriminated against groups in employment. Only 22% of companies are willing to hire persons with disabilities and only 30% will hire Roma.</p>	<p>ENAR Shadow Report 2010/2011 Racism and related discriminatory practices in Romania</p> <p>http://www.enar-eu.org/IMG/pdf/22_romania.pdf</p>

	<p>Segregation is still a problem, while the schools with a high percentage of Roma are poorly equipped and teachers receive less training hours per year. A high percentage of students who drop out are of Roma. A new law on education clearly states that discrimination of any kind is forbidden.</p> <p>Homophobia is an important problem of the agenda of different religious and right-wing organizations from Romania.</p>	
<p>1. Study of Islamophobia phenomenon; 2. Analysis racism in Romania and its transposition in discrimination in education, employment, health, political and social life;</p>	<p>The purpose of this report is to outline an overview of racism and discrimination from Romania in the period from March 2011 to March 2012. While this central punctual year is enclosed in Shadow Reports on Muslim community, albeit there are few information available regarding this community in Romania.</p> <p>The high unemployment rate increases the risk of exploitation of domestic and migrant workers. Some cases involving domestic workers have been reported, but the media rarely reports cases involving the abuse of migrants.</p> <p>Discrimination in housing primarily takes the form of residential segregation and insecurity of tenure. The living conditions of the Roma community are appalling. Those living in rural area also encounter considerable difficulty regarding housing. Roma are exposed to serious health problems because of individual factors (refusal of medical staff to treat them), structural factors (unemployment, lack of social security documents) or personal behavior (food habits, lack of basic information on health issues, self-administration of drugs).</p> <p>Disabled people, the Roma and the LGBT community are among the most discriminated against groups in accessing various goods and services in Romania. Most common forms of discrimination are related to access to services, access to public places, to education, employment and housing.</p> <p>Unqualified immigrant workers abuse is the most frequent committed as unpaid salaries, improper working conditions, contractual amendments, misinformation and communication in a language they are unable to comprehend.</p>	<p>ENAR Shadow Report 2011/2012 Racism and related discriminatory practices in Romania</p> <p>http://www.enar-eu.org/IMG/pdf/romania.pdf</p>
<p>1. Inclusion regarding relevant organisms and civil society attending in discrimination combating;</p>	<p>This section from Yearly Report focuses on the exploration of the means to improve the protection of fundamental rights in EU member states, including Romania.</p> <p>FRA research in 11 EU Member States shows that one out of 10 Roma children of compulsory school age in Greece and Romania are working outside their home. Working conditions are generally unsafe, as their occupation mostly consists of collecting objects for reselling or recycling, or begging on the street for money.</p>	<p>Fundamental rights: challenges and achievements in 2013 – Annual Report 2013 European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights</p>

<p>2. Agreed understanding of the problems supposed to be approached and of the methods applied against discrimination;</p> <p>3. Ensuring full synergy and avoid overlaps, especially with Europe`s Council regarding discrimination;</p> <p>4. Identification of EU`s added value for action for combating discrimination;</p> <p>6. Ensuring transparency and equality regarding inclusion;</p>	<p>On the basis of the data obtained by FRA, official data collection mechanisms on crimes with racist, anti-Roma, anti-Semitic and Islamophobia/anti-Muslim motivations in Romania, data collection is limited to a few incidents, and data are, in general, not published.</p> <p>The development and adoption of the national Roma integration strategies has not implied substantial changes in the use of EU structural funds, but many governments, including local authorities, put new or planned activities on Roma integration on hold, often referring to austerity measures as the reason for funding cuts. In Romania, some projects, conceived within the national action plans and strategies, requested funding but received none. A wide gap persists between Roma and non-Roma children in education. Roma children across the EU fare worse in terms of enrolment, participation, educational attainment and completion. On average, 89 % of Roma surveyed in a FRA Roma pilot survey had not acquired any upper secondary education, compared with 38 % of the non-Roma living nearby. Roma girls in particular drop out from school early. Other forms of educational support for Roma were initiated to promote primary school completion. Poland introduced financial support for books and school materials, while Cyprus, Romania and Slovakia provided free school meals. Several EU Member States continued to deploy Roma school mediators and assistants. In Romania, school principals were instructed on the rights of the child, and some teachers received education in the Romani language and Roma history.</p> <p>To increase the proportion of Roma students in universities, Romania allocated a quota of places for them, benefiting approx. 3,000 secondary school students.</p> <p>Despite measures to improve access to the labor market and professional qualifications, Roma continue to face discrimination both in access to employment and in the workplace. The availability and affordability of social housing and promoting non- discrimination in access to housing are particularly important. Poland, Portugal and Romania also renovated housing or improved social housing conditions.</p> <p>The social and economic integration of Roma, who for centuries have been socially excluded and marginalised, will be a gradual process.</p>	<p>http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra-2014-annual-report-2013-2_en.pdf</p>
--	---	--

<p>1. Identification of the researchers examining DIU issue in Romania 2. Phenomenon contextualization by reporting to DIU manifestations in European space 3. Highlight of DIU incidence in Romania as well as the way the institutions relate for combating DIU;</p>	<p>The paper summarizes the main European and international approaches on DIU and thoroughly describes main institutions and European jurisprudence in this domain. A particular attention is paid to DIU historical context in Romania. For Romanian practitioners the study is important because it firstly accounts the main institutions with competence in DIU combating and relevant national legislation and, on the other hand, it circumscribes the phenomenon in local context together with defining main target groups, issuers and channels for study dissemination. For Romanian context, the study brings an analysis of legislation and institution with responsibility in DIU combating. ENAR Report 2010-2011 identifies Roma, Hungarians and Jews as the predominant targets of hate speech in Romania.</p>	<p>Discursul instigator la ură în România http://www.fdsc.ro/library/files/studiu_diu_integral.pdf</p>
<p>1. Definition of hate speech in national legislation 2. Criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature</p>	<p>The forms of hate speech in Romanian law are instigation to hatred (also called instigation to discrimination) and discriminatory acts. Instigation to hatred (to discrimination) and discriminatory acts, only the former is defined as a crime in the Romanian Criminal Code.</p> <p>In Romania, the categories which are the most likely to be targets of any kind of discrimination, including hate speech, are persons who are either infected with HIV/AIDS, belong to the LGBT community, are part of the Roma population or are disabled.</p> <p>In Romania the most common decisions are related to freedom of expression and public reputation or image and these issues are judged by the civil courts especially for assumption of civil liability and payment of damages.</p>	<p>International Legal Research Group on ONLINE HATE SPEECH Final Report – No hate, No hate speech movement http://elsa.org/page/online-hate-speech-legal-research-group/</p>

<p>1. Disseminate information about the hate crimes occurred in Romania from 2010 to 2014.</p>	<p>Romania regularly reports hate crime data to ODIHR. The reports contain official country information, Civil society information, information from intergovernmental organizations and also, information gathered from representatives of OSCE ODIHR from visits in Romania.</p> <p>2014:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 25 hate crimes were recorded by the police and 20 of them were prosecuted. Also, a specialized bureau for protecting national cultural heritage was established within the General Inspectorate of the Romanian Police. - 3 violent attacks against Christians and members of other religions occurred <p>2013:</p> <p>Anti-Semitism World Without Nazism reported one physical assault and one incident of the desecration of a Holocaust memorial.</p> <p>Bias against LGBT people The ACCEPT Association reported one incident involving numerous threats during the screening of a film in connection with LGBT History Month.</p> <p>2012:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Bias against LGBT people ACCEPT reported two cases of physical assault, both resulting in serious injury, including one carried out by a group against seven young women, two of whom were hospitalized. - Transgender Europe (TGEU) reported two physical assaults against transgender people. <p>2011:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Bias against Roma and Sinti Romani CRISS reported a series of clashes between Roma and the majority community over the course of 24 hours in Racos, resulting in seven physical assaults committed by a group, including two involving serious injury and one against a child. - Bias against LGBT people 	<p>OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR)</p> <p>Hate Crime Reports: 2014, 2013, 2012, 2011, 2010 http://hatecrime.osce.org/romania?year=2014</p> <p>http://hatecrime.osce.org/what-hate-crime/racism-and-xenophobia</p> <p>http://hatecrime.osce.org/romania</p>
--	---	--

	<p>Accept Association reported four cases of physical assault against gay men, including two physical assaults at a nightclub and one physical assault after a pride event; one case of property damage; and one case of threatening behaviour at a documentary screening in Bucharest.</p> <p>2010: - Bias against Roma and Sinti Romani CRISS reported a serious physical assault and an arson attack targeting a Romanian citizen of Hungarian origin.</p>	
<p>1. An overview of racism at European level (patterns of racist crimes, the nature of these crimes and the effects on victims).</p>	<p>Report on racist crime based on 26 national questionnaire responses from EU Member States and Iceland that covers the period from 1 January to 31 December 2013. The report pays special attention to the patterns of racist crimes, the nature of these crimes and the effects on victims.</p> <p>Aspects identified in Romania:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - among the ethnic and religious minorities across Europe in Romania the Roma population represents 7.05% of the inhabitants. - no /limited information about racially motivated crimes or complaints based on official data. - no victimization surveys are made for providing information on gender, age, race, ethnicity, or religion of victims. - civil society organizations working with victims of racially motivated crime are under-funded. - legislation regarding racially motivated crimes - organisation provide victims with simple and accessible information(e.g.: their rights, legal assistance and legal aid, making complaints and requesting eventual protection measures, assistance services) 	<p>European Network Against Racism</p> <p>Racist crime in Europe ENAR Shadow Report 2013 – 2014</p> <p>http://www.enar-eu.org/IMG/pdf/shadowreport_2013-14_en_final_lowres-2.pdf</p>

<p>The report aims to raise awareness of the violence against women in the European Union.</p>	<p>A comparative report on violence against women based on interviews with 42,000 women across the 28 Member States of the European Union. Women were asked to provide information about their experiences of physical, sexual and psychological violence, about stalking, sexual harassment, and the role played by new technologies in women's experiences of abuse.</p> <p>The Romania's main results obtained in the study are smaller compared with the EU average in the majority of cases. For example, at the physical, sexual and psychological violence category, the percent of women who have experienced sexual violence since the age of 15, is 5% compared with the EU average of 7%. Romania's results can be found at: http://fra.europa.eu/en/vaw-survey-results</p>	<p>European Agency for Fundamental Rights</p> <p>Violence against Women: A EU-wide Survey, 2014 http://fra.europa.eu/en/publication/2014/violence-against-women-eu-wide-survey-main-results-report</p>
--	---	---

Spain

Country - España	Objectives	Brief abstracts (what do they say)	Bibliography reference
<p>Penal Code 2015 <i>Justice Ministry</i></p>	<p>Update the old penal code.</p>	<p>The contents of the document are: It includes the legal provisions for crimes in Spain.</p>	<p>ISBN: 978-84-340-2235-5</p>
<p>Law 62/2003 of 30 December on fiscal, administrative and social measures. <i>Head of State</i></p>	<p>Stablishing the legal framework to combat discrimination based on racial or ethnic origin of persons in all areas; and the legal definition of discrimination, direct and indirect.</p>		<p>BOE-A-2003-23936</p>
<p>Law 19/2007, of 11 July against violence, racism, xenophobia and intolerance in sport. <i>Head of State</i></p>	<p>Determining a set of measures aimed at eradicating violence, racism, xenophobia and intolerance in sport</p>		<p>BOE-A-2007-13408</p>

Report incidents of hate crimes in Spain 2013 <i>Ministry of Interior</i>	Collect statistics on hate crimes based on Crime Statistics System (SEC)	Offer statistics about incidents of hate crimes: evolution, territorial representation, victim profile, the profile and conclusions responsible.	
Report incidents of hate crimes in Spain 2014 <i>Ministry of Interior</i>	Collect statistics on hate crimes based on Crime Statistics System (SEC)	Offer statistics about incidents of hate crimes: evolution, territorial representation, victim profile, the profile and conclusions responsible.	
Comprehensive strategy against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance <i>Ministry of Labour and Integration</i>	To answer different situations that Spain is facing: 1. The already existing in Spanish society, which has increased as a result of the new immigration reality social diversity. 2. Answer the call by the UN World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Forms of Racial Discrimination and the recommendations of other international organizations. 3. The need to coordinate actions in this regard are being developed.	Develop an integral strategy against the racism, discrimination, xenophobia and other intolerance forms.	NIPO: 790-11-185-9
Evolution of the Racism and the Xenophobia in Spain [Report 2010] <i>MTIN - Oberaxe</i>	Offering an analysis of the Spaniards attitudes towards migrants and racism	Results of research. Statistics about migration and integration and racism	ISBN: 978-84-8417-378-6
Evolution of the Racism and the Xenophobia in Spain [Report 2011] <i>MTIN - Oberaxe</i>	Offering an analysis of the Spaniards attitudes towards migrants and racism	Results of research. Statistics about migration and integration and racism. Includes vision and stereotypes perception regarding migrants.	ISBN: 978-84-8417-422-6

Evolution of the Racism and the Xenophobia in Spain [Report 2012] <i>MTIN - Oberaxe</i>	Offering an analysis of the Spaniards attitudes towards migrants and racism	Results of research. Statistics about migration and integration and racism. Includes vision and stereotypes perception regarding migrants.	ISBN: 978-84-8417-450-9
Evolution of racism, xenophobia and related intolerance in Spain [Report 2013] <i>MTIN - Oberaxe</i>	Offering an analysis of the Spaniards attitudes towards migrants and racism	Results of research. Statistics about migration and integration and racism. Includes vision and stereotypes perception regarding migrants.	ISBN: 978-84-8417-463-9
Evolution of racism, xenophobia and related intolerance in Spain [Report 2014] <i>MTIN - Oberaxe</i>	Offering an analysis of the Spaniards attitudes towards migrants and racism	Results of research. Statistics about migration and integration and racism. Includes vision and stereotypes perception regarding migrants.	ISBN: 978-84-8417-486-8
Support Manual for Training Security Forces in the identification and registration of racist and xenophobic incidents. <i>MTIN - Oberaxe</i>	Communicate and disseminate the teaching during training sessions attended by more than 150 trainers of various security forces and bodies, to raise awareness and training on equal treatment and non-discrimination on racial or ethnic origin different police forces.	It provides information to the police regarding key concepts relacinoados with hate crimes, a diagnosis of the current Spanish reality, policing strategies for the identification and monitoring of racist crimes and a selection of good policing practices.	NIPO: 270-12-109-3
Annual report on the situation of discrimination and the principle of equal treatment based on racial or ethnic origin in Spain 2010		The contents of the document are: - Conceptual, normative and institutional framework - The social perception of discrimination - The promotion of equality and non-discrimination in Spain	NIPO: 860-11-152-6

<p><i>Ministry of Health, Social Policy and Equality</i></p>			
<p>Annual report on the situation of discrimination and the principle of equal treatment based on racial or ethnic origin in Spain 2011 <i>Ministry of Health, Social Policy and Equality</i></p>		<p>The contents of the document are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Conceptual, normative and institutional framework - The social perception of discrimination - The promotion of equality and non-discrimination in Spain 	<p>NIPO: 680-12-114-1</p>
<p>Police Guidelines for Managing Diversity. VV.AA</p>	<p>Provide information to help improve contact and the relationship between police and social groups that are discriminated against, and to sensitize and train those responsible for law enforcement in the fight against discrimination and attention to cultural diversity and social</p>	<p>The contents of the document are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Concept of combating discrimination and ensuring equal treatment. - Diverse society and equal treatment - Legal and institutional framework in the fight against discrimination - The Politics of Public Security and the Police Management of Diversity - Assistance to victims of discrimination and hate crime - Conclusions. Key elements for police management of diversity - Glossary, bibliography, legislation and resources 	<p>M-15109-2013</p>

<p>Hate speech, criminal law and Sport. <i>José Manuel Ríos Corbacho</i></p>	<p>Insights on hate crimes in the field of sport and its relationship with administrative offenses and criminal offenses.</p>	<p>The wave of racist and xenophobic actions have flooded sports stadiums show the need to address the problem not only from the perspective of administrative law, but also from the criminal, because the sport has been branded in recent times such violence. In this work a vast casuistry which will give analysis fulfilled through a brief study on the issue based on two mechanisms of social control is displayed, both the sports administrative law and criminal law of sport.</p>	<p>ISSN 1695-0194</p>
<p>Hate speech and political speech. In defense of freedom of the intolerant. <i>Rafael Alcácer Guirao</i></p>	<p>Study on the impact of sentences condemning hate speech on freedom of expression.</p>	<p>The judgment of the Court of Criminal Manresa of 11 November 2011 sentenced a member of a political party as the perpetrator of a crime of incitement to violence, discrimination and hatred (art. 510 CP), for facts consistent distribution of a pamphlet campaign. This paper attempts to show that the sentence is contrary to freedom of expression, both serious constitutional doubts that the provision applied as presented by the misapplication of it to the facts of the case itself. In line with such criticism, the limits in a democratic society should be established to freedom of expression in the area of hate speech are analyzed.</p>	<p>ISSN 1695-0194</p>

<p>Equal treatment and non-discrimination Guide recommendations for training security and police forces. <i>Concha Antón y Carmen Quesada</i></p>	<p>Offering educative resources to train and sensitize policial forces.</p>	<p>Guide recommendations for training security and police forces</p>	<p>NIPO: 201-08-051-9</p>
<p>Definition of Violence, criminal procedure, from an intersectional analysis of transphobic violence. <i>Alba Barbé i Serra.</i> Pag.5.204 – 5.207</p>		<p>Approach to the relationship between the Hate Crimes and Hate Crimes, and the integral preservation of the rights of people who conduct practical cross-dresser or transvestite.</p>	<p>ISBN: 978-84-697-0505-6</p>
<p>The specialization of the prosecution in the Field of hate crimes. <i>Cristina Guerri</i></p>		<p>In 2009 it was established in the Barcelona Provincial Prosecutor Service Hate Crimes and Discrimination in order to provide a specialist to offenses that threaten the principles of equality and non-discrimination answer. Following that precedent, since 2013, every province of Spain has a tax specialist in this field. Therefore, the objective of this study was to determine the situation of hate crimes and discrimination in Spain, see the problems that these present and know what a specialized service within the prosecution brings to the fight against this type of crime , explaining the recent expansion of the model. Also, it is discussed in greater depth the issue of</p>	

		<p>hate speech because, to be powered by the use of information technologies such as the Internet and the rise of various parties of the extreme right in Europe has generated a lot of debate about the need and the convenience of its regulation both nationally and internationally. This paper concludes that the specialization of the prosecution is a very important in the fight against hate crimes tool, but should not be the only one.</p>	
<p>Hate Speech in Spain: the Case Law Evolution of the Last Decade. <i>Andrés Gascón Cuenca</i></p>		<p>Hate Speech is an increasing problem that, in the last decade, is acquiring a special relevance, at both the international and the National level. The increase of the utilization of the freedom of expression in order to legitimize hatred advocacy, particularly, against minorities, is a behaviour that is jeopardizing the social cohesion of our societies. The objective of this piece of research is to study the Spanish case law in the last decade in this field, in order to know how it developed.</p>	<p>ISSN: 1138-9877</p>
<p>The Hate speeches. <i>Ángela Sierra González</i></p>		<p>To reflect, by analyzing the speeches of hatred, is how they are at the origins of certain violent conflicts of differing types, and how historically have been linked to the cyclical expansion of authoritarianism, militarism, racism, ethnic-based nationalism and the various religious fanaticism, violence against women, both of which maintain</p>	<p>ISSN 1137-070X</p>

		<p>or, at least, have historically maintained a certain compatibility of values and similar distinctions between good and evil, truth and falsehood, right and wrong.</p>	
<p>The "Cyberhate" the new face of the message of hate speech: between cybercrime and freedom of expression. <i>M.^a Aránzazu Moretón Toquero</i></p>	<p>Analizing the hate speech in internet</p>	<p>Within the sphere of the struggle against the most extreme forms of social discrimination and exclusion, the fact that a large proportion of such behaviour takes place through the internet has recently been highlighted. Freedom of speech, ease of access, and the anonymity that the Net provides, all of which make it a globalizing means of communication, are also ideal conditions for committing abusive acts, some of which fit into the generic category of «crimes of hate».</p> <p>The increasing prominence of Internet as a mass media, its special peculiarities, and enormous potential for reaching all parts of the world —mainly used by the young on a daily basis—, are factors that have favoured the use of cyberhate in an attempt to provide a term to fit all the different ways of broadcasting hate messages through this medium, and thus make them worthy of special interest. It is in this sphere that such well known problems as the categorization of the so-called «hate speech» and its compatibility with freedom of speech arise once more in a new dimension, in this case even more accentuated, as the</p>	<p>ISSN: 2254-3805</p>

		Internet's inspiring principle is, indeed, just that, freedom of speech.	
The "hate speech" and its ban <i>Ricardo Cueva Fernández</i>		In our contemporary multicultural societies there are several cultural patterns of and disparate	ISSN: 0214-8676
The Global Citizenship or Classification of the Citizenship? Minority Groups and Hate Speech. <i>David Martín Herrera</i>	With this article, we intend to define the concept of citizenship in Europe, the consideration of the «citizens» which contribute to the maintenance of the «welfare state», and the measures being taken by the European Union and other European countries when the political speech is focused against minorities.	The dynamic transformations we have been experimenting in our society for the last decades are, without any doubts, the result of globalization processes. The homogeneity that characterized traditional society has been replaced by a democratic, multicultural society, which sometimes still continues with its traditional diversity and disregards the different. Consequence of migration processes, wars, political instability, economic crises, natural disasters, ethnic or political persecution, human trafficking, etc. have forced entire populations to move in urgent need in search of protection or a better future	

		<p>and to leave their origins, homes and families behind. The harsh and cruel reality that these people face to reach their destinations (in case they do reach them), goes unnoticed by the majority of the host population, and is often accompanied by a lack of acceptance, or even considered an affront to the community, the cultural traditions, the job market. Often, people see immigration linked to increased insecurity, which, in extreme situations, can lead to discriminatory attacks against any member of the immigrant group or against their few possessions. In turn, sometimes it is the government itself which discriminates these «citizens» directly by denying them services, or indirectly through its agents.</p>	
<p>The Hate Factory. Xenophobia and Racism in Europe. <i>Enzo Traverso</i></p>		<p>Racism and xenophobia are not residues from a "past that does not pass", archaisms which survive the disappearance of the conditions that made them possible. Cata-clismos the twentieth century we have not been vaccinated against the temptation to stigmatize, con-tra exclude habit and sometimes against the pleasure of hating diversity. From this point of view, contemporary xenophobia is deeply linked to the history of racism, substrate of a modernity that changes its morphology, but not its function. Therefore, it is necessary historicizing</p>	<p>ISSN: 2172-9506</p>

		racist factory otherness, if we understand how it is perpetuated until today.	
The limitation of the fundamental right to freedom of expression in the Hate Speech: Criminal Law of the Enemy (G. JAKOBS)? o Law Minimum penalty (L. Ferrajoli)? <i>Andrés Gascón i Cuenca</i>	Presenting the existing problems about the limitations in the jurídicos ¹ systems, that limit the exercise of the fundamental right to freedom of expression, when it is used in hate speech.	The definition as a crime for conducts arising from hate speeches which are given by exercising the fundamental right to freedom of expression, are widely discussed by commentators. Some of them have identified it with the GÜNTER JAKOBS' theory of Criminal Law of the Enemy. This theory has been much discussed by LUIGI FERRAJOLI and his Minimum Criminal Law project. In this paper, I develop a model of protection from hate speech, studying the characteristics of the proposed models by the referenced authors, with the purpose of finding out if those models would hold the suggested protection.	
Criminal policy in Spain and xenophobic discrimination: the centrality of the crimes of incitement to discrimination. <i>Jesús Bernal del Castillo</i>	The study of this crime under Spanish law is an example of the need to advance the Criminal Law to behaviors that involve a manifest danger of generating violence and discriminatory actions.	Current multicultural societies in Europe have their origins in the massive immigration phenomenon. Cultural differences and problems of integration of minorities generate considerable social unrest, claiming in its more severe manifestations the recourse to criminal law. It is necessary to legitimize criminal law intervention in an appropriate criminal political model, adequate to European political and social settings.	http://www.politicacriminal.cl/Vol_09/n_18/Vol9N18A3.pdf

		Community and liberal models are replaced by a Criminal Policy that takes as reference the protection of the right to non-discrimination, which is derived from the dignity of the person and the protection extended to groups or collectives. This orientation is specified in the definition of different discriminatory offenses, among which stands out as the central reference, the offense of incitement to discrimination.	
Discriminatory hate as an aggravating circumstance of the criminal responsibility <i>Juan Alberto Díaz López</i>	PhD Thesis .	Analyze the role of hatred in shaping the aggravating admitted by the jurisprudence	http://hdl.handle.net/10486/11312
Action Protocol of the Security Forces to hate crimes and behaviors that violate laws on discrimination <i>Ministerio del Interior</i>	Offering a protocol that establishes the body of evidence that must be collected and incorporated into the police report, in order to provide prosecutors and judges with sufficient prima facie that allow allocation and file charges, if any, convictions.	The Action Protocol for the Forces of State Security reviews the set of behaviors that violate the criminal law and administrative and includes bias indicators that reflect the evidence that must be properly collected and included in the police report in order to provide prosecutors and judges sufficient prima facie that allow allocation and file charges, if any, convictions.	

<p>The immigrant as a victim of crime and legal protection <i>Sebastián Salinero Echevarría</i></p>	<p>PhD Thesis.</p>	<p>In this paper we studied from a theoretical and empirical perspective the immigrant and its relation to victimology, explanations about their victimization, and has gone from being a subject of risk to a person at risk, so we can, from experience, visible criminal victimization that affects them. In addition, we studied the secondary victimization, ending minding the immigrant as an criminal in the relationship delict, both when is sentenced, as when he is convicted and may be exposed to the expulsion for the criminal justice system or a series of other discrimination that occur in the execution of conviction. In the second part of our work, we analyze in general, certain specified crimes affecting immigrants, and that its occurrence not only produces victimization in the individual subject affected by the offense, but also within the group of belonging to the victim and, sometimes, in the whole society.</p>	<p>L. 970-2013 http://hdl.handle.net/10803/120149</p>
<p>Hate Speech: jurisprudential developments (1995-2011) Art. CP 510 and proposed Lege Lata. <i>Jon-Mirena Landa Gorostiza</i></p>	<p>Explore how it can be interpreted that article 510 lege lata CP after the Constitutional Court (STC 235/2007) and the Supreme Court (STS 259/2011) have ruled on the issue and to a jurisprudential reality almost no implementation type criminal in question.</p>	<p>The contents of the document are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Convictions and acquittals: numbers and cases - Legal basis: the typical scope of Article 510 under criminal law - Lege lata interpretative proposal in light of the STC 235/2007 and the case law of the ECHR 	<p>UNED. Revista de Derecho Penal y Criminología, 3.a Época, n.o 7 (2012)</p>

<p>Practical Guide to Equal treatment journalists, media and Roma community <i>Fundación Secretariado Gitano</i></p>	<p>To deep in the fundamental right such as equality, their enjoyment of the Roma community and the responsibility that the media have about it.</p>	<p>The contents of the document are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Roma community and the media. - Cases of discrimination collected by the FSG - Roma community and the media. recommendations - The configuration of the social image - The negative image of the Roma community - The social responsibility of the media - The situation of the Roma community in Spain and Europe 	
<p>Islamophobia Report 2014. <i>Plataforma Ciudadana contra la islamofobia</i></p>	<p>Offering an analysis regarding islamophobia in Spain for the year 2014</p>	<p>The contents of the document are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Executive summary of the work of the organization 2014 - Islamophobia in Spain Report 2014 - Islamophobia in numbers 	
<p>Islamophobia Report 2013. <i>Plataforma Ciudadana contra la islamofobia</i></p>	<p>Offering an analysis regarding islamophobia in Spain for the year 2013</p>	<p>The contents of the document are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Executive summary of the work of the organization 2014 - Islamophobia in Spain Report 2014 - Islamophobia in numbers 	
<p>Islamophobia Report 2012. <i>Observatorio Andalusí</i></p>	<p>Offering an analysis regarding islamophobia in Spain for the year 2012</p>	<p>The contents of the document are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Executive summary of the work of the organization 2014 - Islamophobia in Spain Report 2014 - Islamophobia in numbers 	
<p>Proxi Report 2015 <i>Observatorio Proxi</i></p>	<p>Sharing knowledge and good practices regardin Proxi Project</p>	<p>The contents of the document are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Executive summary - Contextualization - Results of the PROXI Observatory - The impact of PROXI - Recommendations - Conclusions: the future of PROXI 	

<p>Legal report on aporofobia, hate the por VV.AA.</p>	<p>Development of a legal report analyzing crimes of aporofobia ("aporos" poor, without resources, "phobia": rejection), situations of violence being committed against homeless people.</p>	<p>Analysis of the Aporophobia and its inclusion as hate crime in the Spanish Legal Framework</p>	
<p>Raxen Report (since 1999, every year)</p>	<p>Provide information about legal framework (national and international), context analysis regarding hate and discrimination and crimes. Collect hate crimes, incidents and hate speech.</p>		<p>http://www.movimientocontralaintolerancia.com/html/raxen/raxen1.asp http://www.movimientocontralaintolerancia.com/html/raxen/raxen.asp</p>
<p>Annual Report - S.O.S Racismo (since 2012, every year)</p>	<p>Provide information about legal framework (national and international), context analysis regarding hate and discrimination and crimes. Collect hate crimes, incidents and hate speech.</p>		<p>http://www.sosracismomadrid.es/web/blog/category/informe-anual/</p>

United Kingdom

Objectives	Brief abstracts (what do they say)	Bibliography reference
Literature- review based research to explore and assess what is known about the perpetrators of hate crimes and their motivations.	Based upon a detailed review of the literature in terms of what is known about hate crime offenders and offending nationally and internationally, it is intended that the findings of the study should frame and steer subsequent more detailed empirical analysis of hate crime data. The findings from the literature review are based around six key questions: (1) who are the perpetrators of hate crimes; (2) what kinds of acts are involved in hate crimes; (3) where do hate crimes take place; (4) why do perpetrators commit hate crimes; (5) when do perpetrators engage in different kinds of hate-motivating offending (6) how do perpetrators acquire their prejudiced views and attitudes. The study proposes recommendations within the context provided by the Welsh Government's, Tackling Hate Crimes and Incidents: A Framework for Action.	Dr Roberts, Colin; Prof Innes, Martin; Dr Williams, Matthew; Dr Tregidga, Jasmin; Prof Gadd, David (2013) "Understanding who commits hate crime and why they do it". Welsh Government Social Research. http://www.mesmacnortheast.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/08/understanding-who-commits-hate-crime-and-why-they-do-it-en.pdf
Research into acts of hate, prejudice and targeted hostility.	This Executive Summary presents the key findings of the Leicester Hate Crime Project in concise form. It has been structured to outline victims' experiences and expectations collectively, although where significant variations between and within groups have emerged, these have been identified. The Leicester Hate Crime Project outlines three broad aims: 1. to discover as much as possible about people's experiences of hate, prejudice and targeted hostility; 2. to understand the physical and emotional harms suffered by victims and their families; and 3. to identify ways of improving the quality of support offered to victims. The research methods included a hard-copy and online survey, in-depth face-to-face interviews, and researcher field diary observations. The project produced a 'Victim's Manifesto' which contains 10 recommendations, including a call for early intervention, empathetic treatment of victims, awareness-	Chakraborti, Neil; Garland Jon; Hardy, Stevie-Jade (2014) "The Leicester Hate Crime Project: Findings and Conclusions (Executive Summary)", University of Leicester https://www2.le.ac.uk/departments/criminology/hate/documents/fc-full-report

	raising; well-publicised and well-staffed reporting mechanisms, and non-punitive responses to hate offending.	
Research into LGBT hate crime reporting.	In 2014 Chakraborti and Hardy began a programme of tailored work with LGB&T communities in Leicester and Leicestershire with the aim of encouraging greater levels of hate crime reporting. This project was awarded funding from the Equality and Human Rights Commission through the tender entitled 'Preventing and Tackling Homophobic, Biphobic and Transphobic Hate Crime'. This report presents the findings from this project and has been structured to outline LGB&T peoples' experiences and expectations of hate crime reporting, and to provide best practice guidance.	Chakraborti, Neil; Hardy, Stevie-Jade (2015) "LGB&T Hate Crime Reporting: Identifying Barriers and Solutions" http://www.equalityhumanrights.com/about-us/our-work/key-projects/preventing-and-tackling-lgb-and-t-hate-crime/news-and-reports-lgb-and-t-hate-crime-project
Research into hate crime victimisation in Wales across seven victim types.	This paper presents findings from the All Wales Hate Crime Project- the largest and most comprehensive academic study of hate crime in the UK. The paper examines the psychological and physical impacts of hate crime across seven victim types drawing on quantitative and qualitative data. The paper provides empirical credibility to the impacts felt by hate crime victims on the margins who have routinely struggled to gain support. Focus is given to the differences in the impacts of hate crime between victims with different identities.	Williams,M.L. and Tregidga, J. 2014. Hate crime victimisation in Wales: psychological and physical impacts across seven hate crime victim types. British Journal of Criminology, 54 (5): 946-967. https://orca-mwe.cf.ac.uk/59624/1/Williams%20%20Tregidga%20-%20Hate%20Crime%20Victimisation%20in%20Wales.pdf
The primary aim of the research was to generate robust data on both the nature of hate crime and hate-related	This research into hate-crime in Wales explored five key areas: (1) the impact of hate crime; (2) the nature of perpetration; (3) hate crime reporting; (4) satisfaction with police and criminal justice system; (5) the provision of support for hate crime victims. Ten recommendations were made, including the need for sustainable funding to hate crime support services; the need for increased public awareness; clear pathways through the reporting system, and the use of effective and restorative approaches used to deal with hate crime perpetrators.	Williams,M.L. and Tregidga, J. 2013. All Wales Hate Crime Project Research Overview and Executive Summary.

<p>incidents in Wales and the impact of that victimisation on individuals, their families and local communities.</p>		
<p>An independent academic review of the work and data that has come out from the Tell MAMA project (Measuring Anti-Muslim Attacks) which is organised by Faith Matters.</p>	<p>The aims of this report are as follows: To analyse the TellMAMA dataset, covering the period 1 April 2012- 30 April 2013 inclusive, in order to provide a quantifiable overview of perpetrator profile, attack type, and location occurrence; To examine the under-studied relationship between anti-Muslim hate crime and the far right.</p>	<p>Prof. Copsey, Nigel; Dr Dack, Janet; Littler, Mark; Dr Feldman, Matthew (2013), "Anti-Muslim Hate Crime and the Far Right". Centre for Fascist, anti-Fascist and Post-Fascist Studies, Teeside University.</p> <p>https://www.tees.ac.uk/docs/DocRepo/Research/Copsey_report3.pdf</p>
<p>Extensive statistics around hate crime, cyber security, and the experience of crime among children.</p>	<p>This bulletin is the third and final in a series of supplementary volumes that accompany the main annual Home Office Statistical Bulletin, 'Crime in England and Wales 2010/11' (Chaplin et al., 2011). The bulletin covers three topic areas: (1) The extent and perceptions towards hate crime; (2) Use of the internet and cyber security; (3) Experimental statistics on the experience of crime among children aged 10 to 15.</p>	<p>"Hate crime, cyber security and the experience of crime among children: Findings from the 2010/11 British Crime Survey: Supplementary Volume 3 to Crime in England and Wales 2010/11" (2012) Kevin Smith (Ed.), Deborah Lader, Jacqueline Hoare and Ivy Lau.</p>

		http://www.report-it.org.uk/files/hosb0612-2.pdf
Study exploring the circumstance and prosecution of disability-related hate crimes.	<p>Public acts of hostility and harassment against disabled people are characterised in law as hate crime when they are accompanied by evidence of prejudice. But, rather than protecting and deterring, the offence of hate crime invites and depends on the identification of a person as different, thereby reinforcing culturally embedded ideas of normality and disability. As a result the law is based on disablist assumptions of disabled people as inferior. The law is also based on ideas and practice that presume ablebodied-ness and thereby risks marginalising disabled people with whom the criminal justice system can find it difficult to work.</p> <p>The study identified two key problems in that: (1) the criminal justice system cannot by itself provide an effective response to the problem [of disability-related hate crime], and that “to ask disabled people to define themselves individually as objects of hatred in the eyes of the law demands a great deal in a culture which is often unthinkingly disabling”.</p>	Piggott, Linda (2011) “Prosecuting Disability Hate Crime: a disabling solution?”. People, Place & Policy Online: 5/1, pp.25-34.
Exploration of racially-motivated hate crimes in the UK in the wake of the 9/11 (2001) and 7/7 (2005) terror attacks.	This paper asks what happened to racially motivated hate crimes in the wake of the 7/7 terror attack that hit London in July 2005 and the 9/11 terror attack that hit the US in September 2001. There is anecdotal and statistical evidence of an increase in bias-motivated crimes since the 9/11 terrorist attacks in the US, but little quantitative research on the issue. This study offers empirical evidence on the effects of 7/7 and 9/11 on hate crime using rich data from four police force areas in England with sizable Asian/Arab populations. We find significant increases in hate crimes against Asians and Arabs that occurred almost immediately in the wake of both terror attacks, which subsequently decayed, but remained at higher than pre-attack levels a year later. We argue that this demonstrates a significant link between terror attacks and increases in hate crime and hypothesise that attitudinal changes resulting from media coverage may act as an underlying driver.	Hanes, Emma; Machin, Stephen (2013) “Hate Crime in the Wake of Terror Attacks: Evidence From 7/7 and 9/11”.

<p>A research review of some of the initiatives that have been established to manage hate crime offenders.</p>	<p>The aims of the research were to: (1) identify from an international search, programmes designed for the rehabilitation of hate crime offenders; (2) determine the transferability of programmes, or elements of them, for practice learning in the UK; (3) Make recommendations for the design and delivery of rehabilitative programmes for hate crime offenders in the UK. The UK programmes identified share with those in Europe a commitment to the acceptance and understanding, rather than the rejection and condemnation, of racially motivated offenders, and have shown that it is possible to work with them constructively while firmly conveying that racist attitudes and behaviour are not acceptable. On the basis of the research findings, and in the context of the 2010 Equality Act, a number of recommendations are made for the design and delivery of programmes for the rehabilitation of hate crime offenders in the UK.</p>	<p>Iganski, Paul; Smith, David. “Rehabilitation of Hate Crime Offenders” (2011). Submitted to the Equality and Human Rights Commission (Scotland).</p>
<p>Annual CPS hate crime report which provides information on its performance in prosecuting hate crimes in 2013/14.</p>	<p>The report considers performance in relation to hate crimes during 2013/14. It illustrates this performance through available management data as well as positive outcomes in casework. It also provides examples of effective practice, lessons learned, policy development and research that have all contributed to improving performance.</p>	<p>“Hate crimes and crimes against older people report” (2014). Crown Prosecution Service.</p>
<p>Report on the extent and nature of transphobic hate crime and the impact on victims with regards to their attitudes towards criminal justice agencies.</p>	<p>This report is based on findings from The Sussex Hate Crime Project (SHCP) currently being undertaken at the University of Sussex on the direct and indirect impacts of anti-LGBT hate crimes. This report will focus on the extent and nature of transphobic hate crime and the effects that this type of crime has on trans* people’s attitudes towards criminal justice agencies and, more broadly the government, in relation to hate crime. Findings revealed that: trans people were significantly more likely than non-trans LGB people to have been a direct victim of hate crime; that anti-LGBT hate crime is highly repetitive for trans people; that direct and indirect anti-LGBT hate crime effects trans peoples’ attitudes towards the government and criminal justice agencies.</p>	<p>Dr Walters, Mark; Dr Paterson, Jenny (2015), “Transphobic hate crime and perceptions of the criminal justice system”. Written evidence submitted by University of Sussex to the Transgender Equality Inquiry.</p>



Co-funded by the Rights, Equality and
Citizenship (REC) Programme
of the European Union